

PERMANENT CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE TO THE MTA
MINUTES OF MARCH 2, 2017

A meeting of the Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee (PCAC) to the MTA was convened at 12:00 noon on March 2, 2017 in the MTA Board Room at 2 Broadway, New York City.

The following members were present:

Andrew Albert	Christopher Greif
Mark Epstein	William K. Guild
Orrin Getz	Marisol Halpern
Randy Glucksman	Sharon King Hoge
Mike Godino	Trudy Mason
Stuart Goldstein	Scott Nicholls
Ira Greenberg	Edith Prentiss
Larry Rubinstein	

The following members were absent:

Francena Amparo	Owen Costello
Gerard Bringmann	Rhonda Herman
Sheila Carpenter	Maureen Michaels
Richard Cataggio	Raymond Pagano
Francis T. Corcoran	Bryan Peranzo
Burton M. Strauss, Jr.	

In addition, the following persons were present:

William Henderson	-Executive Director
Ellyn Shannon	-Associate Director
Angela Bellisio	-Planning Manager
Bradley Brashears	-Transportation Planner
Karyl Cafiero	-Research Associate
Chief Owen J. Monaghan	-MTA Police
Debra Greif	-BFSSAC
Yvonne Morrow	-Concerned citizen
Richard Schulman	-Concerned citizen

PCAC MINUTES

2

Approval of Agenda and Minutes

The agenda for the March 2, 2017 meeting was approved. The minutes of the December 1, 2016 meeting were approved.

Chairs' Reports

A copy of the written Chairs' reports are attached to these minutes.

Council Chairs' reports were previously distributed to the members.

Randolph Glucksman presented the PCAC Chair's report. There were no questions.

LIRRCC

It was noted that the LIRRCC Chair's Report was not distributed in advance, but copies were made available at the meeting.

Edith Prentiss asked what is happening with regards to the inaccessible waiting rooms at St. James and Pinelawn. Mark Epstein responded that the LIRR is reviewing the status of waiting rooms as a part of the second track project making them accessible.

Trudy Mason said that Congresswoman Maloney was informed that the funding for Phase 2 and 3 of the Second Avenue Subway are on the Trump Administration's list of potential infrastructure projects. There were no further comments on LIRRCC Chair's Report.

MNRCC

Mr. Glucksman asked for comments or questions on the MNRCC report.

Christopher Greif asked whether Metro-North will acquire any new coaches soon. Mr. Glucksman responded the Railroad will not and that the M9 electric multiple unit cars will be the next passenger cars to join Metro-North's fleet.

NYCTRC

Andrew Albert asked for comments or questions on the NYCTRC Chair's report and there were none.

Ms. Mason stated that the Chair's report should have included a meeting held between Council staff and members and NYC Transit Department of Buses personnel.

PCAC MINUTES

3

Old Business

No Old Business was discussed.

New Business

Mike Godino stated that the LIRR is implementing mobile ticketing but that the system the Rail Road is implementing is not accessible. Specifically, the system is not compatible with screen readers used by persons with visual disabilities. He said that there is a need for issues such as this to be examined and for the Rail Road to make sure that systems are accessible before they are implemented.

Mr. Henderson said that part of the problem with mobile ticketing was the haste with which this system was implemented. Ms. Prentiss noted that the Help Points are still not accessible, so haste is not always the issue.

Orrin Getz asked whether the Port Jervis Line capacity improvements study presentation that was recently released is available on the MTA website. Ellyn Shannon responded that it is.

Mr. Albert said that due to problems at LaGuardia Airport, the LaGuardia Link bus has been temporarily made free of charge in an attempt to reduce automobile traffic to the airport terminals. He said that the MTA will probably not lose much money from the change because most people would transfer to the bus from other NYC Transit services.

Bradley Brashears presented the draft PCAC 2016 Annual Report and said that the final version would be available shortly.

Mr. Greif requested the committee be updated on the status of Freedom Ticket. Mr. Albert commented that he has attended many meetings and given interviews with the press. He has spoken to Robert Foran within the MTA, and consideration of the proposal is moving forward. Ira Greenberg said that the discussion of Freedom Ticket should eventually lead to a discussion of fare policy generally at the PCAC level. Mr. Epstein commented that he wanted to make sure that LIRR service between Long Island from Penn Station is maintained and that there is a need to be sensitive to this issue as Freedom Ticket is discussed.

The Committee discussed potential service plans for the LIRR after the opening of East Side Access. Mr. Albert questioned whether riders would go to different terminals once the project opens and said that the implications of this change should be considered. Mr. Godino commented that he is interested that riders of Brooklyn-bound trains to keep their one seat ride from Long Island. Mr. Henderson said that

PCAC MINUTES

4

the ability to provide one-seat rides is very dependent on riders' origins and destinations. Mr. Rubinstein noted that there could be significant waits involved in trips including a transfer.

The group discussed the expected conditions at Jamaica station when Brooklyn service is reconfigured as a shuttle. Ms. Prentiss stated that the plan for transferring from train to train using elevators is going to be a disaster. Mr. Albert commented that the PCAC should get the service plan that will go into effect when East Side Access is implemented. Mr. Epstein stated that the LIRRCC has been asking for a service plan for years, only to be told that it is still under development. Ms. Shannon asked whether a guest from the LIRR should attend an upcoming PCAC meeting. Mr. Epstein and Mr. Rubinstein said that it would be more fruitful for the LIRRCC to discuss the post-East Side Access service plan with the LIRR.

Mr. Greif said that he believes that implementing a Freedom Ticket pilot will aid low income families and that the Brooklyn Borough President agrees. He said that he has spoken to many people who would be benefitted by Freedom Ticket and that the PCAC's concern should be with its impact on riders.

Presentation: Chief Owen J. Monaghan – MTA Police Department

Mr. Glucksman introduced Chief Monaghan.

Chief Monaghan commented that PCAC is a group that he wanted to collaborate with as Chief and that he has tried to work with the community throughout his career. He said that he has been doing police work for some time but is not new to the MTA family. Chief Monaghan previously served as a Vice President with NYC Transit, a civilian position, working on property protection. He said that he has had a passion for this area for 20 years.

Prior to joining the MTA family, Chief Monaghan served with the NYPD Transit Bureau, which gave the MTA a sense of his ability to take over policing at MTA. The transit policing is very different from municipal policing. The issues are different; in transit policing keeping people moving is a primary focus.

Chief Monaghan proceeded to give the Council an overview of the MTAPD.

The MTAPD is comparable to the New York Yankees of transportation policing. There are 720 sworn officers, which is far more than any other Transit police system. There are also more challenges than in other places and they occur 24/7. Bringing things down to a basic level, the Chief said that he wants everyone's family members to be treated well and protected.

In addition, the MTAPD covers a wide area, running to New Haven and Poughkeepsie to the North and the East End of Long Island. The Department is

PCAC MINUTES

5

broken into nine commands each run by a Captain or Deputy Inspector. They use uniformed personnel for visibility, and officers are on foot throughout terminals and major stations. Other officers are in radio cars. The Department takes pride in responding to incidents quickly. Chief Monaghan said that the MTAPD has the best K9 patrol unit of all Transit police. These units are capable of clearing unattended packages and helping commuters.

In some circumstances, the MTAPD deploys and patrols with heavy weapons. Officers use the MP5 long gun, which is a force multiplier that gives the MTAPD a way to deter potential problems.

The MTAPD highway unit is focused on grade crossing enforcement. Chief Monaghan said that there is a need to change the behavior of people who do not realize what a train traveling at 70 mph can do. There is also an Emergency Services Unit that works with the other units as needed. The Chief said that earlier in the day there had been an incident with a fatality at Glen Head and that he had gone to the scene to observe and introduce himself to the officers there.

Chief Monaghan said that his overall vision is to increase uniform officers' visibility and to have riders see officers as attentive and ready to protect them. As a part of protecting riders, the MTAPD maintains counterterrorism capability through attentiveness, intelligence, and collaboration. He said that MTAPD leadership had met with Suffolk County Police and increased collaboration and will continue to engage in close operations with other police departments. An example of this is working on Staten Island with the NYPD to conduct step on-off operations on Staten Island Railway trains.

The Chief said that the MTAPD has to do its part in easing the commuter experience and serve as partners with operating agency presidents in keeping the system moving. To do this, MTAPD commanders emphasize that functions that MTAPD performs must be in concert with the MTA's operating agencies and aimed at keeping operations going.

The MTA has been effective, with there were 306 index crimes last year in MTAPD territory, which was the same as 2015. This translates to a extremely low rate per passenger. MTAPD detectives have a very high closure rate, because of cameras in facilities and their relationships with the community.

The department faces policing challenges unique to its mission. Homeless individuals are a challenge for all law enforcement agencies, but particularly so in a transit environment. The approach that is taken is to deploy resources and offer services and to focus enforcement on people who disrupt others' commute. In addition to the homeless, graffiti and metal thefts are unique challenges for transit policing agencies.

PCAC MINUTES

6

Chief Monaghan asked for questions from the members. Mr. Epstein invited Chief Monaghan to come to an upcoming LIRRCC meeting to discuss specific questions related to the LIRR.

Mr. Goldstein asked whether the Chief inherited any resource issues from his predecessor. Chief Monaghan said that his team is conducting an analysis to right size the parts of the organization and that this analysis is in progress.

Mr. Goldstein asked if there is cross training across commands within the Department. Chief Monaghan replied that there are difference in the areas covered by the MTAPD, but officers regularly move between the regions.

Ms. Prentiss stated that she has an issue with “Segway” type scooters in elevators, where they take up all the space. Chief Monaghan commented that these units are known as T3s. Ms. Prentiss responded that the officers often cannot drive these units properly. Chief Monaghan explained that the concept of using T3s was introduced by the NYPD and that the units are valuable because they keep officers visible by raising them up. He said that the MTAPD would consider her comments with reference to the T3s use at Times Square.

Mr. Prentiss asked what happened to the street level post at 34th Street and Penn Station and said that without this post, people are using hand trucks in the elevator.

Ms. Mason complimented the MTAPD force.

Marisol Halpern wanted to know where areas of responsibility end for the NYPD and start for the MTAPD. Chief Monaghan said there are often lines around stations showing jurisdiction, but each police agency assists in neighboring jurisdictions.

Scott Nicholls stated that Great Kills station is a hub for drug activity. He gave complements to Officer Steve Lugorini but said that train patrol seems to be non-existent as he does not see police on trains.

Mr. Greif commented that there is a homelessness problem at Atlantic Terminal as well as Penn Station. There seems to be a problem with people sitting at the station and riders feel that there is a safety concern with people on the platform level.

William Guild asked the Chief to expand on his discussion of jurisdictional lines among police agencies. Chief Monaghan replied that there are differences in policing transit and commuter rail including that people are less transient in commuter rail. Nevertheless, there are more similarities than differences in transportation policing and the various agencies seek to work together.

Mr. Getz said that there is a booth for police at the Spring Valley station, but local police do not use it. He said that he would like something done with the booth. Chief

PCAC MINUTES

7

Monaghan thanked Mr. Getz and said that he will discuss the police booth as MTAPD speaks to local police agencies in the community.

Mr. Albert said that he was happy to hear about a renewed focus on the homeless on E, C and R trains. He noted that there is an issue with people selling swipes at the Jamaica Air Train terminal and that there is a widespread fare evasion problem. Chief Monaghan said they can work with Chief Fox and Chief Coogan to deal with challenges that involve NYC Transit. He noted that he also has an interface with NYC Transit's Eagle team.

Mr. Rubinstein said he has seen rampant sales of swipes at Jamaica from MetroCards begged from tourists. He also asked whether the MTAPD is involved in providing protection for the President of the United States. Chief Monaghan responded that his department is well aware of the issue at Jamaica, but that protection of the President is out of their jurisdiction

Karyl Berger noted that there is an issue with people seated on steps leading to the Apple store at Grand Central Terminal. She was told that the space is Apple's property. Chief Monaghan replied that keeping the way clear should be an MTAPD responsibility.

Richard Schulman stated that there is a problem with post hockey crowds on trains and suggested that officers patrol these trains. He said that the LIRR is losing fares because of conductors not walking the trains. Chief Monaghan said he will look into this situation

Ms. Prentiss asked whether there are restrictions on scooters, skateboards, and the like on trains and in stations. Chief Monaghan said that there are and they should be enforced. Mr. Greif said that he found out that morning that "showtime" dancers are now performing on the LIRR.

Mr. Epstein asked if the MTAPD has noticed increases in problems since there is a cell signal in subway stations. Chief Monaghan said he did not have experience with this issue in the subways and does not know whether it is a problem now.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 2:00 pm

Respectfully submitted,

William Henderson
Executive Director