

**PERMANENT CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE TO THE MTA**  
**MINUTES OF 3/8/2018**

A meeting of the Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee (PCAC) to the MTA was convened at 12:00 noon on 3/8/2018 in the 16th Floor Conference Room at 2 Broadway, New York City.

The following members were present:

Andrew Albert	Christopher Greif
Gerard Bringmann	William Guild
Orrin Getz	Trudy Mason
Randolph Glucksman	Edith Prentiss
Stuart Goldstein	Larry Rubinstein
Burton Strauss, Jr.	

The following members were on the phone:

Francena Amparo	Marisol Halpern
-----------------	-----------------

The following members were absent:

Sheila Carpenter	Ira Greenberg
Richard Cataggio	Rhonda Herman
Francis Corcoran	Sharon King Hoge
Mark Epstein	Scott Nicholls
Mike Godino	Raymond Pagano
Bryan Peranzo	

In addition, the following persons were present:

William Henderson	-PCAC Executive Director
Ellyn Shannon	-PCAC Associate Director
Bradley Brashears	-PCAC Planning Manager
Sheila Binesh	-PCAC Transportation Planner
Shaun Wong	-PCAC Intern
Tim Ellis	-MTA
Amy Paulin	-NYS Assembly
Alan Treffeisen	-NYC Independent Budget Office
Yvonne Morrow	-Concerned citizen
Eric Wollman	-Concerned citizen
Richard Schulman	-Concerned citizen
Michael Howard	-Concerned citizen
Alan Flacks	-Concerned citizen

# PCAC MINUTES 3/8/2018

2

## Time Point

<b>Video Part 1</b>	
00:07	<b>Approval of Agenda</b> for March 8, 2018 <b>and Minutes</b> for 12/7/2017 were approved
	<b>Introduction of Speaker: Assemblywoman Amy Paulin</b>
00:28	<b>Chairs' Reports (Attached)</b> Council Chairs' reports were distributed to the members. Andrew Albert presented the PCAC Chair's report.
11:23	<b>LIRRCC</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The brutal winter caused unreliable service.</li><li>• Cars still out of service.</li><li>• LIRR is trying to work with taxi commissions on price gouging.</li></ul> <b>Price Gouging During Major Delays</b> <p>E. Shannon: What local regulations like? G. Bringmann: There are county and town licenses. Enforcement is the problem. W. Henderson: The LIRR must clearly communicate, how to report price gauging complaints. S. Goldstein: Taxi companies lease space from LIRR and should have leverage over them. MTA Real Estate Dept. should consider gouging history, when renewing contracts. E. Shannon: Post rate signs in taxis and stations? G. Bringmann: Can't because there are zones. A. Paulin: The law identifies Director of Consumer Protection (CP) with the authority to investigate price gouging, a good avenue to pursue. CP should be aggressively going after it. If there is a problem with them go to the County Executive.</p> <b>Action Item: Discuss taxi price gouging with Director of Consumer Protection</b>

# PCAC MINUTES 3/8/2018

	<p>LIRR Continuing problem:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Lack of communication during service outages, unclear announcement for which stations.</li><li>• Discussion of communication technology and wrong/old announcements.</li></ul>
26:54	<p><b>MNRCC</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Chairman Lhota came to our committee meeting to seek our opinion about appointing Cathy Rinaldi as president of Metro-North.</li><li>• Pascack Valley Line experiencing problems and cancelled trains from storm.</li></ul> <p>O. Getz:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Trying to establish dialogue with new NJT Executive Director.</li><li>• NJT is desperate to get 40 Maryland (MARC) cars when they have several that need to be repaired.</li><li>• No update on PTC compliance. Amtrak will only allow NJT to run to Penn station if it has PTC compliance</li></ul>
32:04	<p><b>NYCTRC</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• New NYCT president focusing on <i>Bus Action plan, accessibility, and new elevators</i> to fit into smaller spaces.</li><li>• L train open houses, electric buses are coming, Freedom Ticket to Penn station, second part of the Second Ave subway construction,</li><li>• Subway action plan has reduced major incidents 30-40% where it is in use.</li></ul>
<b>Video Part 2</b>	
00:00	E. Prentiss: Bus changes will be made within the current budget?
01:05	E. Shannon: The problem is there are only 16 routes authorized to have bus lane cameras

## PCAC MINUTES 3/8/2018

### 4

10:05	C. Grief: Asked for cameras to be in the R211 train, regarding safety and homeless levels.
12:20	T. Mason: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Work on 6 line is causing increased delays. Wrong times on countdown clocks. Trains passing through stops. There is a lack of communication with customers.</li><li>• SBS bus lines and bus lanes aren't clear.</li></ul> W. Henderson: Bus lane cameras are on fixed locations along routes.
18:53	<b>Congestion Pricing Resolution</b> Review of new resolution. Resolution passes PCAC with majority vote.
23:23	T. Mason: Motion to distribute resolution to Mayor, Governor, Legislative leaders, City Council, Sam Schwartz, FixNYC panel, and put out press release.  <b>Action Item: Resolution distributed to Mayor, Governor, Legislative leaders, City Council, Sam Schwartz, FixNYC panel, and put out press release.</b>
25:44	<b><i>Introduction of Guest Speaker: Assemblywoman Amy Paulin. Chair of the NY State Assembly Committee on Corporations, Authorities and Commissions</i></b>
<b>Video Part 3</b>	
00:00	Ms. Paulin: Represents commuters MTA is the circulator of economic activity and shouldn't take for granted. <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• There should be equal access and distribution of public services. Inefficient oversight. Need funding for long overdue improvements to fix very old infrastructure. Need reliable subway.</li></ul>

**PCAC MINUTES 3/8/2018**

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Worst LIRR service in decades, short trains, and overcrowding. Delays have a pronounced effect on the economy</li><li>• East Side Access is too expensive</li><li>• FixNYC is a good start. I support Congestion Pricing, it provides long-term sustainable funding for the MTA and reduces congestion.</li><li>• I support value capture. MTA needs new sustainable long term finance.</li><li>• There is still \$7.3 billion left unfinanced in the 2018 capital plan. There is only 32 billion for the 2019 plan. Congestion pricing was going to fund the capital plan. Need to educate the Legislature. Start bombarding Albany with these issues.</li><li>• Oversight and Accountability</li><li>• Met with Joe Lhota and Pat Foye, Catherine Rinaldi: Leadership is committed to turning around the MTA.</li><li>• Need to be able to trust the numbers. Looked into Con Edison power incidents and there were only 198 not 32 k – only 32 were actual power outages. We lose confidence in our system, in our board, council, and representatives. Appreciate the honesty regarding the overcrowding delays, but this should be the norm.</li><li>• State comptroller's report on adequate safety compliance, should hold train operators accountable. Transparency is import to improve the MTA to reinforce public confidence. Hold employees accountable to its own policy and need to know if that impacts safety.</li></ul>
15:16	A. Albert: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• There isn't parking space just outside of the CBD and trains are very crowded at that point.</li><li>• Second Ave Subway was expensive because of the complicated</li></ul>

**PCAC MINUTES 3/8/2018**

	<p>underground environment, due to density and building foundations.</p> <p>A. Paulin: It's not explained well and still too expensive. When you are distant from the conversations it's difficult to know this and easier to think if they can fix those problems the MTA doesn't need any more money.</p>
18:03	<p>E. Shannon: With the last Capital Program we did a project called <a href="#">Keep NY on Track</a> to improve transit literacy with high level thought leaders. MTA presented the data to the community to convey why the needs are so great.</p> <p>A. Paulin: Looking forward to hearing about the capital plan. Look for City and State financing. City has to contribute. Was disappointed there wasn't a more aggressive plan in the Governor's Executive Budget.</p>
21:20	<p>(Congestion Pricing discussion)</p> <p>Only FixNYC study :The assembly doesn't understand that there needs to be an infrastructure before implementation Funding should go to upstate NY where there isn't public transit.</p> <p>Budget Process: Governor proposes and puts Executive budget it out there for 30 days/21 day amendments</p> <p>All agreed on revenue: 3 way revenue condition: 675 million to use. 65 million was cut from MTA budget and wasn't added back.</p> <p>Pass 1 house resolutions this Wednesday and go into conference committees the next day. Will have three documents: Senate resolution, Assembly resolution, and Governor's executive budget.</p> <p>We convene conference committees - on the transportation conference committee - and go into negotiation off those documents. No new</p>

**PCAC MINUTES 3/8/2018**

	concepts have come in. The governor hasn't put (congestion pricing) on the table, the senate has rejected it and the assembly has softened. Will have to be passed before the holidays.
28:25:	E. Prentiss: Can money be diverted to ski resorts in this year's budget? A. Paulin: No money can be diverted
28:56	T. Mason: Politics come into play with everything: The feud between city and state funding. A. Paulin: That's why it's not in the budget this year because of the polling.
30:49	A. Albert: No one has yet detailed to elected officials and residents of Brooklyn and Queens the transit improvements congestion pricing brings to their areas, since most of them use mass transit. A. Paulin: That will be through the capital plan.
31:34	T. Mason: Could you share your views on the city and the state tensions? A. Paulin: I can only tell you what my job is: to ensure we have a reliable MTA system. The Governor has put a lot of mandates on the city, which is not wise - but if enough NYC members. I'm involved at the state level so I'm responsible for convincing my colleagues that MTA needs more revenues to support the capital plan.
33.12	R. Glucksman: My predecessor is your colleague on the committee? A. Paulin: Yes, we have a good representation.
<b>Video Part 4</b>	
00:35	C. Greif: We are concerned with accessibility, platform edges, and gaps between the platform edges - which impact wheelchair

**PCAC MINUTES 3/8/2018**

	users being able to use the subway. LIRR is better A. Albert: The subway has several car classifications and commuter rails have 2
03:40	E. Prentiss: We need a forum for those of us who ride. A. Paulin: That would be a capital plan component over operating.
04:54	M. Howard: R46s should have seats taken out of cars to fit people in wheelchairs. Save money by cutting bus service.
06:15	O. Getz: I'm from Rockland County and we are concerned about our lack of representation on the MTA board – do not have even 1 vote.  <b>Action Item: Ask State for more Metro-North representation on MTA board</b>
07:19	T. Mason: Who is on the capital program review board? A. Paulin: Mike Benedetto
12:00	End of Questions to Amy Paulin
	<b>Old Business</b>
12:56	C. Grief: When is Andy Byford visiting? He will be at the NYCTRC meeting.  <b>Action Item: Schedule President Byford for NYCTRC meeting</b>
14:42	B. Strauss: I asked about police enforcement of bus lanes and state enforcement.
16:21	E. Prentiss: At the end of last meeting there was a question about a bus forum. A. Albert: NYCT President Byford is coming up with a bus action plan Discussion of bus forum and outreach. <b>Action Item: Bus forum</b>



## **PCAC MINUTES 3/8/2018**

**9**

23:00	<b>Adjournment</b>
-------	--------------------

[Meeting Video part 1 of 4](#)

[Meeting Video part 2 of 4](#)

[Meeting Video part 3 of 4](#)

[Meeting Video part 4 of 4](#)

### **Action Items:**

- **Send resolution to Mayor, Governor, Legislative leaders, City Council, Sam Schwartz, FixNYC panel, and put out press release.**
- **Hold bus forum and outreach for event**
- **Ask state for Metro-North representation on MTA board.**
- **Invite Andy Byford to NYCTRC meeting.**
- **Talk to Director of Consumer Protection about taxi price gouging along LIRR station**

The meeting was adjourned at 2:15 PM.

Respectfully submitted,  
William Henderson