



# PCAC

PERMANENT CITIZENS  
ADVISORY COMMITTEE TO THE MTA

## Meeting Minutes of December 6, 2018

A meeting of the Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA (PCAC) was convened at 12:00 noon on December 6, 2018 in the MTA, 16th Floor, Conference Room C16.08, 2 Broadway, New York, New York 10004.

### Member Attendance

Andrew Albert (Chair)	Present
Randolph Glucksman (Vice Chair)	Present
Francena Amparo (MNRCC)	Absent
Gerard P. Bringmann (LIRRCC)	Present
Sheila Carpenter (LIRRCC)	Absent
Richard Cataggio (MNRCC)	Absent
Francis T. Corcoran (MNRCC)	Absent
Mark J. Epstein (LIRRCC)	Present
Orrin Getz (MNRCC)	Present
Ira Greenberg (LIRRCC)	Present
Michael Godino (LIRRCC)	Absent
Stuart Goldstein (NYCTRC)	Present
Christopher Greif (NYCTRC)	Present
William Guild (NYCTRC)	Present
Marisol Halpern (NYCTRC)	Present
Rhonda Herman (MNRCC)	Absent
Sharon King Hoge (NYCTRC)	Absent
Trudy L. Mason (NYCTRC)	Present
Scott R. Nicholls (NYCTRC)	Present
Raymond Pagano (LIRRCC)	Absent
Bryan Peranzo (LIRRCC)	Absent
Marilyn N. Poterson (LIRRCC)	Absent
Edith M. Prentiss (NYCTRC)	Present
Larry Rubinstein (LIRRCC)	Phone
Burton M. Strauss, Jr. (NYCTRC)	Absent

### Staff Attendance

Lisa Daglian (Executive Director)	Present
Ellyn Shannon (Associate Director)	Present
Bradley Brashears (Planning Manager)	Present
Sheila Binesh (Transportation Planner)	Present
Karyl Cafiero (Research Associate)	Present
Deborah Morrison (Administrative Assistant)	Present

### Non-member Attendance

<u>Name</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>
Robert Foran	MTA

## PCAC MINUTES

2

Helene Fromm  
Andrew Lynch  
Rick Horan  
Gary Caparelli  
Mo-Yain Tham  
Sophia Reuss  
Rachel Bernzweig  
Lorelei Christie  
Eric Wollman  
Yvonne Morrow  
Michael Howard

MTA  
Queens Rail  
Queens Rail  
Queens Rail  
Jobs to Move America  
Jobs to Move America  
Jobs to Move America  
Jobs to Move America  
Concerned citizen  
Concerned citizen  
Concerned citizen

***Approval of Agenda for December 6, 2018 meeting.  
Approval of Minutes for September 6, 2018 meeting.***

### ***Chair's Report attached.***

This is Ira Greenberg's last PCAC meeting, as he will be serving as a Civil Court Judge for Queens County. He is presented with parting gifts. Round of thanks and appreciation for his services.

Fare hearings: Members and staff have been representing the Councils and PCAC at the fare hearings; there are still two hearings left – in Brooklyn and Rockland County. T. Mason suggests making yourself known to the media whenever you represent PCAC. Andy Byford was profiled on 60 Min TV program.

### ***Board Reports:***

#### **NYCTRC Board Report:**

- L train Project: Additional service on G, 7, as well as E, J, M, Z
- 7 line improvement due to CBTC
- Ultra-wideband frequency for signals is being tested.

T. Mason: Congestion Pricing a common topic among NYC public advocate candidates.

#### **Staff Report:**

- Policy procedure officer binder developed
- Developed material for new council member training orientation and also the need for new members.
- Testified at NYC Council Transportation Committee in support of Fast Forward.
- Spoke at December Special Finance Committee meeting, calling for the formation of a transparency working group to create accessible online data portal for riders to understand MTA funding.
- Sentimental Analysis for the L train project to track Twitter sentiments regarding the project and level of service provided. This tool can be used on a variety of topics.
- Staff retreat: Staff development session will be held with a goal of creating a foundation for strategic plan

## PCAC MINUTES

### 3

- Presentation on 2018 budget overview and proposed 2019 budget
  - Budget includes staff and member professional development
  - Budget includes hosting future meetings and events

#### *Budget Questions*

C. Grief: Is your salary going up?

L. Daglian: We do not make decisions regarding salaries, but there has been a slight adjustment.

C. Grief: There is a timeline for reimbursements and guidelines should be made clear.

E. Prentis: Are we budgeting for a forum?

L. Daglian: Yes

I. Greenberg: Staff should present on conferences attended so it can be insightful for everyone, all councils.

L. Daglian: Definitely, Karyl has brought this up as well; letting members know what we do.

T. Mason: Not only letting us know what you do, but inviting us to attend.

#### *Amazon Deal*

Lisa has been attending and speaking at several meetings including last month's MTA Committee meeting and Hunter Point's Civic Association (elected officials Michael Gianaris and Jimmy van Bramer's representative were present). The Long Island City (LIC) BID has an upcoming meeting and we will be attending and speaking out for Amazon to fund subway improvements in LIC upon its arrival. We will try to be part of a community working group.

M. Epstein: We must distinguish our role among the other groups regarding the Amazon deal to be solely transit focused.

E. Prentis: LIC is not very accessible. Please include the disability community in the process.

***Vote on proposed 2019 budget: All in favor; Ira Greenberg abstained.***

#### **Introduction of Speakers: MTA Chief Financial Officer Bob Foran and MTA Chief of Staff Helene Fromm**

- Dire financial times for the MTA, even in light of cost saving measures over the years
- If reroutes are within the service guidelines there is no need for a public hearing

#### *Ridership*

A. Albert: We should be clear about how we measure service utilized if it is based on MetroCard swipes, given fare evasion. Do these figures take into account ridership loss with service reductions and how many people would switch to another mode?

R. Foran: No this is the absolute. Service reductions are not going to solve our problems, we would still need 12% fare and toll increases. Without service reductions, a 15% additional fare and toll increase would be needed on top of the proposed 4%.

M. Epstein: Raising the fares 4% is not sustainable, especially on the Railroads, which leads to ridership loss.

R. Foran: I agree, but the MTA only has control over 3 things: cutting costs (which we are trying to do aggressively), cutting service (which we don't want to do), and increasing fares (which we

## PCAC MINUTES

### 4

don't want to do any more than we have to). The City, State, and Legislature have the power to do more. For the railroads it's a 3.8% increase and no ticket increase will be over \$15, especially because they often purchase a MetroCard when they enter the city. The board doesn't want fare increases.

M. Epstein: I see some of the costs are towards overtime, is there any effort to recap some of those payments? The work being done last summer by Amtrak to Penn Station caused the LIRRCC to write a letter to the secretary of USDOT asking for the MTA to be reimbursed for the extra costs borne from Amtrak's lack of upkeep.

R. Foran: We have been in several conversations with Amtrak and the answer has always been no. Amtrak is not in a good financial situation either, which causes problems related to poorly maintained Amtrak facilities. Don't give up pushing.

T. Mason: How would full congestion pricing affect the financial projections?

R. Foran: Depends on how it's set up. It would bring in \$1.5 billion/year and operational costs would be a few hundred million/year. However it would only be passed if it goes toward the Capital Program/Fast Forward and would take 2 years of implementation once passed.

I. Greenberg: The debt of the Capital Program goes out several years. Our debt dollar value is increasing. The City and State pay in only after the last dollar is spent.

R. Foran: Debt service approximates about half of the deficit. In 2023 the debt service will be maxed out.

E. Prentis: Marijuana tax?

R. Foran: The MTA Sustainability Work Group is looking at alternative revenue sources. We are agnostic to where the money comes from. We want to take less of our customers' money. There will be consolidation and personnel actions. Our labor contracts will be renegotiated in spring 2019.

E. Shannon: Use East Side Access and Second Avenue Subway to show you are providing more service with less.

R. Foran: We are already incurring operating costs on ESA due to security.

C. Greif: There is an increase in ridership during peak hours and an increase in fare evasion.

R. Foran: We will cut operating and maintenance costs by investing in the system (Capital Program)

I. Greenberg: There have been separate counts for riding and paying customers

E. Prentis: Bus drivers almost never refuse riders without payment. We all need to step up as a community.

R. Foran: A bus driver was killed in 2008 over fare. We want to keep our workers safe.

S. Nicholls: District attorney not prosecuting fare evasion contributes to fare evasion.

R. Foran: As Andy Byford noted, there is a segment of the population that will always evade.

M. Epstein: Renovation projects where the Rail Road built parking: Are the parking structures profitable or costly?

R. Foran: Marginally profitable, but then we own it. We prefer Private Public Partnerships and TOD to build more with less.

M. Epstein: Should we push for LIRR-owned parking?

## PCAC MINUTES

5

R. Foran: We would love to have control over the parking

S. Goldberg: Use the MTA real estate portfolio to maximize income.

R. Foran: MTA Real Estate is under Janno Leiber. Sale of real estate is reinvested into the Capital Program to avoid selling bonds and incurring debt.

E. Prentis: The MTA should be actively pursuing value capture (especially for elevators)

*Ode to Ira*  
*Ira speech*

***Adjourned at 2:00pm***

### **Action Items**

- Send around new member orientation
- Policy on council member reimbursements and standardized form
- Present on staff actions, events, and conference take a ways
- Share fare evasion presentation from Special Finance Committee meeting

### **Video Links**

[Part 1](#), [Part 2](#), [Part 3](#), [Part 4](#)

The meeting was adjourned at 2:01 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa Daglian  
Executive Director