



PCAC

PERMANENT CITIZENS
ADVISORY COMMITTEE TO THE MTA

Meeting Minutes of

March 5, 2020

A meeting of the Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA (PCAC) was convened at 12:00 noon on March 5, 2020 in the MTA, 20th Floor, Conference Room 4, 2 Broadway, New York, New York 10004.

Member Attendance

Andrew Albert (Chair)	Present
Randolph Glucksman (Vice Chair)	Present
Francena Amparo (MNRCC)	
Gerard P. Bringmann (LIRRCC)	Present
Sheila Carpenter (LIRRCC)	Present
Richard Cataggio (MNRCC)	
Francis T. Corcoran (MNRCC)	
Mark J. Epstein (LIRRCC)	
Orrin Getz (MNRCC)	
Stuart Goldstein (NYCTRC)	
Christopher Greif (NYCTRC)	Present
William Guild (NYCTRC)	
Marisol Halpern (NYCTRC)	Present
Sharon King Hoge (NYCTRC)	Present
Trudy L. Mason (NYCTRC)	Present
Scott R. Nicholls (NYCTRC)	
Raymond Pagano (LIRRCC)	
Bryan Peranzo (LIRRCC)	
Marilyn N. Poterson (LIRRCC)	
Edith M. Prentiss (NYCTRC)	Present
Larry Rubinstein (LIRRCC)	
Burton M. Strauss, Jr. (NYCTRC)	Present

Staff Attendance

Lisa Daglian (Executive Director)	Present
Ellyn Shannon (Associate Director)	Present
Bradley Brashears (Planning Manager)	Present
Sheila Binesh (Transportation Planner)	Present
Deborah Morrison (Administrative Assistant)	Present

Non-member Attendance

<u>Name</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>
Anthony McCord	MTA
Sara Bahri	NYCT System Wide Accessibility Unit
Andrew Pollack	Concerned Citizen
Yvonne Marrow	Concerned Citizen

PCAC MINUTES

2

Introduction of Speaker: Anthony McCord, MTA Chief Transformation Officer, speaks about MTA's transformation plans.

E. Shannon: When you are downsizing will you be able to identify in-house talent within departments? And how are you retaining those people?

A. McCord: You can never do enough communication. We entice people to stay longer who are getting close to retirement. Keeping that skill set is important. We reach out to the individuals. Also, our information systems are not perfect. We have an issue of people with titles of jobs that they do not do. For example, at Grand Central we have some who are "engineers", who are actually firefighters.

T. Mason: Have you been in touch with Dick Ravitch? If not, I will get you in contact with him.

A. McCord: Can we get these centralized? I want to get all these important points.

C. Greif: There is concern about the design of the future train cars - R211 and 262s. I was hoping we could work together regarding accessibility and signage?

A. McCord: Mario Peloquin, our COO and colleague, is very concerned about this and we have discussed issues of signage and accessibility, so this is noted. We will get back to you. This is a very important topic.

E. Prentiss: A lot of the cars have become unsuccessful. I hope in transformation there will be a better working relationship with the community and the industry (MTA) to ensure that we are not all on the floor. There is nothing to hold onto for many of us.

S. Bahri: The R211s and 262s train car manufacturers are very much in contact with our train command. We are working with them on the design and we will report to the accessibility team and to APTA.

R. Glucksman: The lack of training – There was an 80-hour class to become a supervisor. I don't know if they still do it here. But that is something to look into.

L. Daglian: I would like to know the interrelation between transformation, innovation, and Mario's position, and the different touch points and the correlation among those three major new positions.

A. McCord: One thing Mario is looking at is how do we share best practices across agencies. It is not a very top-level approach; it is very cooperative – how can we do things better. We have to be very transactional.

T. Mason: As you are doing the reorganization, are you looking at individuals, like Ellyn asked, who you want to keep and maybe not in the positions that they have or are you looking to eliminate positions – and maybe moving people who are good into other positions that they can do?

A. McCord: Anyone who is good is staying. I can tell you that. We need project managers, electricians – so anyone good is staying.

PCAC MINUTES

3

S. Binesh: You mentioned the inaccuracies of reporting people's titles. What data points are you using to implement your changes?

A. McCord: One of the very first things we decided to do – per the AlixPartners report – we are examining the state of the organization. For example, they (AlixPartners) used civil service titles as a starting point to see how many analysts we have, but that is not sufficient. It has to be broken down into have many HR analysts, systems analysts, how many financial analysts, etc... Then you need to know how many resources it requires to do something.

E. Shannon: On retaining people again – Are you looking at the pay scale at the MTA with the hiring freeze and looking at where the salaries are compared to the city? Again, being able to retain people, looking at the pay scales to keep people?

A. McCord: There are two things: labor of volume; and labor of costs. The MTA gives pretty good benefits and we are here for the next hundred years. People can actually plan their lives, which is good. With consolidation you can give people more meaningful levels to move to advance careers.

Approval of Agenda for March 5, 2020 meeting.

Approval of Minutes for December 5, 2019 meeting.

Chair's Report attached.

A. Albert: Quick shout-out to Edith, who will be inducted into the New York State Disability Rights Hall of Fame, at an event to be held on May 28th at the Albany Marriot in Colonie, NY. This is in recognition of Edith's long fight and successful fight I would say judging by accessibility and what is happening at the MTA and elsewhere. Congrats Edith!

- Big news is Andy Byford's departure on February 21st with Sarah Feinberg to be named Interim NYC Transit President.
- Accessibility continues to rollout – Livonia Avenue on the L train will be getting elevators.
- Canarsie tube project is supposed to finish in April.
- Next is closing the Rutgers tube in preparation for CBTC installation on the 8th Ave line.
- MTA Board voted to approve the purchase of 500 open gangway cars. (Discussion ensues and Andrew will ask Sally Librera for a tour in Yonkers at the Kawasaki Plant.)
- One of Andy Byford's last decisions as NYCT President was how to replace and install elevators at the Clark Street station – it was decided to do a complete shutdown to get it over with as soon as possible.

PCAC MINUTES

4

- On-time performance has increased as a byproduct of the Save Safe Seconds and SAP programs – dwell times have lessened – OTP is at 83% now.

Action Item: Andrew to ask Sally Librera for a tour of the open gangway subway cars at the Yonkers Kawasaki Plant.

LIRRCC Chair's Report: G. Bringmann

- Governor Cuomo's announcement of eight new Penn Station tracks – how will this correspond to Penn Station Access (PSA) and how will this be paid for?
- Outer Borough Transit Funds (OBTF) – the timing is bad, as we are faced with a 4% fare increase and have many parking issues with people driving into Queens from Nassau. Sounds good on paper but need to see how this plays out.

MNRCC Chair's Report: R. Glucksman

- Positive Train Control (PTC) – we get monthly updates on the progress of the installation of PTC on Metro-North – everything seems to be on time. We do not get information on how it is going with NJ Transit, which will affect West-of-Hudson service.
- OBTF – There are votes for and against it at the MTA Board – If I had a vote on the Board I would vote against it – it is unfair.

E. Prentiss: Inquires about the increase in cleaning schedules for transit and the commuter railroads?

L. Daglian: The Governor had three press conferences yesterday and the mayor had one and they are talking about precautions to take regarding the Corona virus.

PCAC Executive Director Report:

- The PCAC Annual Report is underway.
- We are still down one staff position and we are still meeting with MTA to get this filled.
- We are testifying before the City Council on Monday for their transportation and budget.
- We have been testifying at MTA Board and Committee meetings.
- We have been going to the bus redesign meetings.

E. Shannon: To Marisol – do you have a Bronx Borough President's office wish list for the bus redesigns?

M. Halpern: I can ask.

Old Business

S. Carpenter: Pleased about the LIRR waiting rooms being open later at 6 and 7 pm.

Y. Morrow: What is the MTA's status on fare evasion? It is a problem on the SBS routes.

PCAC MINUTES

5

A. Albert: Yes, it is a problem. I have not seen any Eagle Team members on buses in over a year now. I know they are trying to spread out. We had a great meeting with The MTA's IG office about this topic. And we know from their report that fare evasion estimates are most likely low and that the methodology is not good.

T. Mason: Have they said anything about the slam gates? There should be signage telling people to exit from the turnstiles and to not hold the doors on the slam gates.

L. Daglian: There will be a new methodology next quarter in counting fare evasion. There is a taskforce at the MTA that is looking to see where the disconnects are that Andrew will be pursuing to get answers.

Y. Morrow: There is also a problem with ticket vending machines being broken or taking your money and not issuing you a ticket.

E. Prentiss: At 167th to 168th Streets there are multiple buses lined up at the curb and the other bus that goes around makes no effort to come into the curb and leaves us behind. Also, right by Time Warner the same situation happens. They make no effort to stop because another bus is in the stop.

A. Albert: And you have reported this? With bus numbers?

E. Prentiss: Yes, I reported it to the office; I reported it on the MTA's website.

A. Albert: If it is the same operator doing this, it would be good to know. We can't tolerate this. We need vehicle numbers, etc...

T. Mason: The link for the Grand Central Navigation site needs to be sent out. I looked at it myself – it keeps changing. It is impossible to find where the exits are located.

S. Binesh: I just sent it to you this Monday.

T. Mason: I want it sent to everyone.

S. Binesh: Yes, I will send it to everyone.

Action Item: Sheila to send Grand Central Navigation Site to all PCAC members.

New Business

E. Prentiss: Totally amazed with how they are cleaning the subway. Can we get the cleaning schedule sent to us?

L. Daglian: Yes, but that is such old news it most likely has changed by now. We can try and work on getting the updated list.

Action Item: Updated station and train cleaning list sent to members?

PCAC MINUTES

6

C. Grief: The homeless issue – Is there a way to find out how they are dealing with the homeless on LIRR and MNR?

A. Albert: This is a city problem. Transit has had an unpleasant experience with the Bowery Residents' Committee – they are searching for a replacement. They did not do their job.

L. Daglian: The numbers of homeless have drastically increased – it is a regional problem. More resources will be required.

E. Prentiss: I have not seen any police officers at my accessible stations. Like at 181st – where people have been mugged. With these 500 new officers – maybe we can get one new person for each station?

L. Daglian: These officers are also for LIRR and MNR.

E. Prentiss: I am questioning the distribution.

A. Albert: They should roam and go all over the place. They should not be predictable.

L. Daglian: What we are calling for is data-driven deployment. The data is not shared with everybody to know what the distribution is so fare evaders don't know where and to what extent they are being stationed. There needs to be a sense of clarity.

M. Halpern: Are they using crime-stats to know where fare evasion and crime exists – sharing that information?

L. Daglian: We don't know if and how the three different police forces are using and sharing their data. This is something we are pursuing.

Adjourned

Action Items:

- **Andrew to ask Sally Librera for a tour of the open gangway subway cars at the Yonkers Kawasaki Plant.**
- **Sheila to send Grand Central Navigation Site to all PCAC members.**
- **Updated station and train cleaning list sent to members?**

Video Link:

<https://youtu.be/2zt8JMt4rDE>

The meeting was adjourned at 2:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa Daglian
Executive Director