



# PCAC

PERMANENT CITIZENS  
ADVISORY COMMITTEE TO THE MTA

## Meeting Minutes of

### June 6, 2019

A meeting of the Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA (PCAC) was convened at 12:00 pm on June 6, 2019 in the MTA Board Room, 20th Floor, 2 Broadway, New York, New York 10004.

#### Member Attendance

Andrew Albert (Chair)	Present
Randolph Glucksman (Vice Chair)	Present
Francena Amparo (MNRCC)	Absent
Gerard P. Bringmann (LIRRCC)	Present
Sheila Carpenter (LIRRCC)	Absent
Richard Cataggio (MNRCC)	Absent
Francis T. Corcoran (MNRCC)	Absent
Mark J. Epstein (LIRRCC)	Present
Orrin Getz (MNRCC)	Present
Michael Godino (LIRRCC)	Absent
Stuart Goldstein (NYCTRC)	Present
Christopher Greif (NYCTRC)	Present
William Guild (NYCTRC)	Present
Marisol Halpern (NYCTRC)	Absent
Sharon King Hoge (NYCTRC)	Present
Trudy L. Mason (NYCTRC)	Present
Scott R. Nicholls (NYCTRC)	Present
Raymond Pagano (LIRRCC)	Absent
Bryan Peranzo (LIRRCC)	Absent
Marilyn N. Poterson (LIRRCC)	Absent
Edith M. Prentiss (NYCTRC)	Present
Larry Rubinstein (LIRRCC)	Absent
Burton M. Strauss, Jr. (NYCTRC)	Absent

#### Staff Attendance

Lisa Daglian (Executive Director)	Present
Ellyn Shannon (Associate Director)	Present
Bradley Brashears (Planning Manager)	Present
Sheila Binesh (Transportation Planner)	Present
Karyl Cafiero (Research Associate)	Present
Deborah Morrison (Administrative Assistant)	Present

#### Non-member Attendance

<u>Name</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>
Patrick Warren	MTA
Eric Wollman	Concerned citizen
Michael Howard	Concerned citizen
Joel Ettinger	Concerned citizen
Matt Shotkin	Concerned citizen
Andrew Kurzweil	Concerned citizen

## PCAC MINUTES

2

Kevin Zeng

Concerned citizen

**Approval of Agenda for June 6, 2019 meeting.**  
**Approval of Minutes for March 7, 2019 meeting.**

**Chairs Report attached.**

**Board Reports**

**LIRRCC Board Report**

**MNRCC Board Report**

**NYCTRC Board Report**

Discussion of meeting location and times. Survey will be sent out.

*LIRR Update*

Briefing on Penn Station changes

Attended Governor's press conference announcement on changes at Penn Station

New accessible Help Point at Glen Head, should expand to Queens LIRR stations.

*MTA*

OMNY is in pilot phase and has been working well.

LIRR Mail and ride tickets should be included.

Write a letter in support of Mail and Ride and more easily useable fare, OMNY should include that discount. **Action Item**

Quicker easier and more accessible and easier to refill fare option

**Staff Report**

- Queens bus redesign participation
- Performance Matters – at the commuter rails
- Letter on emergency debarment rules
- Track L train slowdown
- Outstanding member and board appointments
- Monitoring overtime situation
- Accessible wayfinding

**Introduction of Speaker: Patrick Warren MTA Chief Safety Officer**

*Safety and emergency management*

E. Prentiss: There are raised platforms for accessible boarding areas, but the trains don't always stop to match up to the boarding areas. Specifically, on the uptown A line. There is a 2-5 feet gap. **Follow up**

R. Glucksman: On PATH stations, the whole platform is raised to meet the train. I will look into it.

G. Bringmann: LIRR trains open doors where there are no platforms and it is a safety issue. There should be penalties, not only retraining because it is serious.

## PCAC MINUTES

### 3

M. Epstein: Sometime the train crews do not report it and us riders report it.

E. Shannon: Our Council can report these issues but the focus should be on accountability and self-reporting - so the MTA knows how bad the problem is. Both on MNR and LIRR.

P. Warren: There is a *Close Call* reporting system that they can use to report without punishment – but doesn't mean they are using it. **Follow up**

L. Daglian: What is your relationship with the MTA police and other police departments? We are working on the sexual assault policy.

P. Warren: Sexual assault is largely a police issue, unless it deals with the employees (and that would be with their health afterward). I'll take a note and let Owen and Chief Delatorre know about it. Police monitor the camera system. **Follow up.**

#### *Discussion on Cameras*

M. Epstein: Cameras started out on just the LIRR cabs and now there are cameras all throughout the train and riders have privacy concerns. We have been asking for written guidelines for the use of those cameras. Can riders view footage if there is a situation between a rider and a conductor? **Follow up.**

P. Warren: The cameras largely do two things: 1. Forensic search or for an assault 2. To monitor crowding and other station conditions to direct police attention. The cameras are not monitored in real time. Onboard train cameras are similar and not monitored in real time and are archived.

A. Albert: Are the cameras for suicide watch and trespassing monitored in real time?

P. Warren: Not necessarily. Unless there are constant problems in a particular area on watch.

A. Albert: When are cameras coming to the SIR as there are no gates?

E. Shannon: Cameras on onboard would enhance safety in terms of sexual assault (as demonstrated on the London Underground). Will they be included in the Capital Program?

P. Warren: Nearly everything in the Capital Program has a significant safety value to it.

Cameras are being rolled out across the system. There are different grants: Federal, state, and FEMA funds to help us. It's just a matter of time.

E. Shannon: Onboard cameras are not coming on the new subway railcars. **Follow up**

T. Mason: How are external facing cameras on buses used? There is no control over cars parking in bus lanes which cause riders to board the bus in a traffic lane. How can bus drivers report?

L. Daglian: The outward facing cameras should be automatic.

P. Warren: Bus drivers don't have anything to do with the cameras. Sometimes the cameras are monitored later to look for violations. **Follow up**

M. Epstein: As we are pushing for electrification of the LIRR branches, someone was electrocuted trespassing on the live Third Rail. How can we protect people from the live Third Rail and trespassing generally?

P. Warren: Electrified Rail is mostly in the Northeast. There is third rail vs catenary: some are easier to maintain. It's a challenging balance of how restrictive we should be.

A. Albert: There are signs at stations that warn of electrified rail. There should be signs at every access point.

C. Greif: Homeless and unruly passengers can disrupt service and cause safety issues.

## PCAC MINUTES

4

G. Bringmann: Has the MTA done a comprehensive fatalities analysis for reoccurring themes? It could save lives as there are 80-90 deaths per year.

P. Warren: We track every death. Deaths that are caused by improper operation of vehicles are one category – those are small. But there are many trespassers. I don't know about the past analysis. It is worth noting the places in which they occur more often than others.

A. Albert: Since GSM program, has all personnel been given training on what do if a person is reported on the tracks?

P. Warren: Yes, if they know about it.

A. Albert: Are the LIRR and MNR fleets PTC equipment ready?

P. Warren: Yes, all the equipment is on the system and on the wayside. The PTC is required on all passenger rail based on ridership.

K. Cafiero: Are you involved in emergency management training of people with disabilities for front line employees and is there a plan in place that is geared towards people with disability?

P. Warren: Trainings are good ways of getting feedback from the community and making improvements. Alex Elegudin is aware of those trainings.

O. Getz: A problem on suburban rail crossings is cars backing up onto crossing. What is the plan to eliminate this?

P. Warren: Preemption. Synchronize traffic lights to clear crossings.

O. Getz: *Force Off* is a program that automatically modifies the signals regardless if a train is coming.

### **Old Business**

E. Prentiss: The Transit Museum had a training for people with vision impairments: *The Step Program*. After the opening of Fulton St Station, the ADA committee did a tour of the station, which was helpful. The MTA should do outreach to communities when they open new stations for passengers, not only for staff. Riders need information on signage and wayfinding.

T. Mason: Why are outward facing cameras not regularly monitored? Not every bus has a red-light camera. **Follow up**

O. Getz: There is a law in NJ that cars must yield to buses that pull into a traffic lane from a bus stop. The bus has the right of way. There is a sign on the back of buses that warns motorists to yield since buses have the right of way. NY should consider it. **Follow up**

### **New Business**

Discussion of MTA debarment rule

G. Bringmann: No signage of LIRR at Penn Station at 7<sup>th</sup> Ave.

Discussion on wayfinding and accessible signage

**Adjourned at 2:00pm**

## PCAC MINUTES

5

**Video Link:** [Part 1 of 1](#)

**Action Items:**

- Send O. Getz meeting materials in PDF
- Send NYCTRC information on Amtrak work at Penn Station and service changes
- Write a letter in support of maintaining the Mail and Ride tickets and its equivalent in light of OMNY
- Follow up on trains not platforming with the designated accessible boarding areas with raised platforms (uptown A line)
- Follow up on reporting issues and penalties for LIRR/MNR train personnel who open doors where there is no platform.
- Follow up with the relationship between Safety department and MTA police in regard to sexual assault
- What are the written guidelines for onboard camera use on the LIRR?
- Why are new subway cars not equipped with cameras for safety and is it in the Capital Program?
- How are the outward facing cameras on buses monitored?
- *Advocate for NY to adopt the NJ law that motorist must yield to buses pulling into traffic from a bus stop to have the right away.*

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa Daglian  
Executive Director