



PCAC

PERMANENT CITIZENS
ADVISORY COMMITTEE TO THE MTA

Meeting Minutes of September 5, 2019

A meeting of the Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA (PCAC) was convened at 12:00 noon on September 5, 2019 in the MTA Board Room, 20th Floor, 2 Broadway, New York, New York 10004.

Member Attendance

Andrew Albert (Chair)	Present
Randolph Glucksman (Vice Chair)	Present
Francena Amparo (MNRCC)	Absent
Gerard P. Bringmann (LIRRCC)	Present
Sheila Carpenter (LIRRCC)	Absent
Richard Cataggio (MNRCC)	Absent
Francis T. Corcoran (MNRCC)	Absent
Mark J. Epstein (LIRRCC)	Present
Orrin Getz (MNRCC)	Present
Stuart Goldstein (NYCTRC)	Present
Christopher Greif (NYCTRC)	Present
William Guild (NYCTRC)	Present
Marisol Halpern (NYCTRC)	Present
Sharon King Hoge (NYCTRC)	Present
Trudy L. Mason (NYCTRC)	Present
Scott R. Nicholls (NYCTRC)	Present
Raymond Pagano (LIRRCC)	Absent
Bryan Peranzo (LIRRCC)	Absent
Marilyn N. Poterson (LIRRCC)	Absent
Edith M. Prentiss (NYCTRC)	Present
Larry Rubinstein (LIRRCC)	Present
Burton M. Strauss, Jr. (NYCTRC)	Absent

Staff Attendance

Lisa Daglian (Executive Director)	Present
Ellyn Shannon (Associate Director)	Present
Bradley Brashears (Planning Manager)	Present
Sheila Binesh (Transportation Planner)	Present
Deborah Morrison (Administrative Assistant)	Present

Non-member Attendance

<u>Name</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>
Madeline Smith	AM Amy Paulin's Office
Carolyn Pokorny	MTA IG
Danielle Blustein	MTA IG
David Meyer	NY Post
Clayton Guse	Daily News

PCAC MINUTES

2

Andrew Kurzweil
Nora Nussbaum
Paul Goebel
Karyl Cafiero
Paul Burton
Eric Wollman
Michael Howard
Matt Shotkin

RUN
CBC
MBPO
Concerned citizen
The Bond Buyer
Concerned citizen
Concerned citizen
Concerned citizen

Approval of Agenda for September 5, 2019 meeting.
Approval of Minutes for June 6, 2019 meeting.

Chair's Report attached.

Staff report

- Lisa's one-year anniversary! Much has been accomplished since then.
- Working on the Queens and Bronx bus redesigns. We were invited to participate in the round table meetings and to have a table at the upcoming outreach events.
- Bradley and Sheila wrote blog posts on their testimonies from July's meetings.
- Closely working with other advocacy organizations on:
 - Service cuts, transparency, transformation, pushing for the release of the Stantec elevator report, and the funds for the 50 accessible stations.
- Meeting with elected officials: Assemblywoman Nily Rozic, Bronx Borough President Ruben Diaz Jr, Senator Leroy Comrie on the outer borough transit fund and the potential discounts. The analysis should include the opening of East Side Access and the future of Penn Access.
- The sexual assault report and recommendations are coming together.
- Our intern, Uday Schultz, presented recommendations to senior NYCT officials on subway de-interlining and route simplification.
- Lisa spoke on a TransitCenter panel titled, Can Riders Trust the MTA reorganization?
- Big increase in our online presence: an increase in traffic and followers.

NYCTRC

Discussion on the MTA Transformation Plan

We are awaiting the appointment of the Chief Transformation Officer (CTO) to oversee the reorganization. Under the proposed org chart, the CTO is directly connected to the MTA CEO. The COO is under the CEO and potentially the MTA board. The agency presidents are all under the CTO and everyone else is under the CEO. There is an email address where you can provide comments on the transformation plan.

Discussion on the lack of details in the 37-page plan that the MTA board voted to approve. The reorganization was first proposed in legislation on Congestion Pricing when it was passed. The AlixPartners report suggests doing away with silos but creates new silos.

Capital Plan and Service

L. Daglian: We are concerned about the lack of public involvement in the upcoming Capital Plan.

PCAC MINUTES

3

E. Prentiss: I am confused about Larry Schwartz's comments at the MTA board meeting about finding the money the state owes the MTA for elevators and service cuts happening simultaneously.

L. Daglian: Service cuts are from the operating budget and they are talking about finding money for the elevators in the current (2015-19) capital program. The status is still unclear.

A. Albert: Cutting service does not make sense in light of Congestion Pricing beginning soon. The reorg is supposed to consolidate and save money to focus on service. We need dedicated operating funding. There is a large-scale fare evasion attack.

LIRRC

G. Bringmann: How long will the reorganization take and will the CTO position concur with that timeline?

L. Daglian: There are different timeframes but the report refers to 5 years.

M. Epstein: LIRCC's issue is with consolidation of communication into MTA and away from agency specific. When there is a problem the Rail Road can point the finger to MTA and would not be held accountable. Our legislative mandate is with the agency, LIRR, not the MTA. This reduces what we can be involved in.

A. Albert: The AlixPartners report suggests doing away with silos but creates new silos.

MNRCC

R. Glucksman: Even though the Chair's report is focused on West of Hudson, I ride all Metro-North lines, speak to riders and communicate their suggestions to management.

I sent an email to NYCT staff about water on the 1 line tracks at 110th street. It was removed and they are looking into how to prevent it in the future.

C. Greif: Complaints about the MNR ambassadors that assist wheelchair users with boarding.

L. Daglian: We need specific details to report incidents properly.

E. Prentis: The weekend announcements are confusing for MNR trains.

A. Albert: Not that this solves your issue, but the myLIRR.org app will tell you exactly where your train is. The MTA is working to standardize the alerts and keep agencies notified.

Introduction of speaker: MTA Inspector General Carolyn Pokorny

Presentation on the MTA IG current reports

S. Goldstein: What is the biggest challenge in the office you inherited?

C. Pokorny: I wanted to address transparency and make folks aware that there is an IG looking out for them. There is a mechanism for taxpayers, riders, and workers to complain – and they can do so anonymously by phone and email. I see complaints as a good thing and a source of investigations.

E. Prentis: 15 elevators in Washington Heights are being replaced but none make the stations accessible.

C. Pokorny: Accessibility is important to us, as our report on the escalator outages on the Second Avenue Subway shows. I would encourage the public to report specific outages. We look at the MTA's planning and systems in place to stay on top of maintenance and to engage with contractors. Accessibility is key for riders and safety.

PCAC MINUTES

4

C. Greif: The vertical gap / hump can be a safety issue for wheelchair users.

T. Mason: On the homeless issue, what is the contact and cooperation with the Mayor's office?

C. Pokorny: We just look at systems, make recommendations, and ask questions about their implementation. Good interagency cooperation is important. Our power derives from our ability to report and that's why transparency is so important. We have a voice, and follow up and monitor, but we have no power to force the MTA to do anything.

L. Daglian: There is a lack of transparency and opportunity for public input on the MTA reorganization. Is there a way to encourage the agency to move towards public involvement that is in line with their own public participation document?

C. Pokorny: We also value transparency. My office's role is reviewing and publicly reporting on what is happening. We hope to be a voice for the public.

S. Goldstein: Does your office take short-term vs long-term reviews?

C. Pokorny: Yes, we do both. We are starting to do 'flash reports' – putting out reports quickly when we feel comfortable that we have reached the bottom of the issue.

S. Goldstein: What would you about a vendor or staff member that wasn't performing?

C. Pokorny: We would put out a report or audit with recommendations to act on.

L. Daglian: We have expressed concern over the mandatory debarment rule. Do you have a role in the debarment process?

C. Pokorny: We provide technical expertise and guidance to agencies regarding different contractors. It is not our office's role to express an opinion on a particular policy choice that the legislature has made. We do have a role in ensuring that the law is followed and implemented, and monitor the results of doing so.

S. Goldstein: If you had information on a vendor, would they consult you and ask you to weigh in on an issue they are reviewing?

C. Pokorny: Yes, they do consult with our office on problems with different vendors.

A. Albert: For the reporting on debris falling from elevated structures, are you asking NYCT to investigate every mile of elevated track? Are you looking at the relation between the rolling stock and elevated structure?

C. Pokorny: Our review is still ongoing and we are still looking at the data.

T. Mason: How are your reports released to the public? Are there public follow-up reports?

C. Pokorny: All our reports and investigations are posted online and on social media. We are strategically issuing follow up reports. We are posting our older reports online that weren't previously posted. We email reports to board members when they are released.

Old Business

C. Greif: Bus service cuts on the B46.

A. Albert: The buses are longer and have more seats so this is not seen as a service cut

C. Greif: It is a service cut for wheelchair users with less options.

E. Wollman: Please invite the Chief of MTA Police to next PCAC meeting.

PCAC MINUTES

5

T. Mason: Compliments to the manager of the Metro North customer service window at Grand Central who was helpful. Compliments to a 511 operator who told me about the BxM1 bus stop.

New Business

T. Mason: Thank you for writing the op-ed piece on service cuts in Crain's. What was the response?

S. Binesh: We got a lot of response from people who agreed with us and were also shocked by the prospect of service cuts.

T. Mason and M. Shotkin bring up the construction around 79th street in Manhattan that has moved bus stops without signage notifying riders.

Discussion of quarterly PCAC meeting times and location

From the previous vote:

Time: 5 people voted for the same time and 5 people voted to move the meetings to 4pm

Day of week: Most people want to meet on Thursdays

Location: The majority voted to have meetings in midtown near Penn Station.

We can try rotating location for the next meeting. **Action Item: We will send around a poll again that will include ranked voting.**

O. Getz: Coming here (downtown) is most convenient – 12:30 pm would be a better time.

E. Prentis: Alternating meetings times and location is confusing.

M. Epstein: When many LIRRCC members joined the meetings were in midtown which was convenient for them.

Adjourned at 2:00pm

Action Items:

- Send around ranked voting polls of the top choice from the last round of votes on the PCAC meeting location and time.
- Send Trudy Mason Congestion Pricing legislation which included language for the MTA reorganization
- Inquire about the responsibilities of the new hires as part of the Transformation office
- Trudy's compliments were forwarded

Video Link: [Part 1 of 1](#)

The meeting was adjourned at 2:01 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa Daglian
Executive Director