A meeting of the Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA (PCAC) was convened at 12:00 noon on September 9, 2021 on the 20th floor, Conf. Room #4 at 2 Broadway, New York, NY 10004 and on Zoom.

**Member Attendance**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Andrew Albert (Chair) | Present |
| Randolph Glucksman (Vice Chair) | Virtual |
| Francena Amparo (MNRCC) | Absent |
| Gerard P. Bringmann (LIRRCC) | Present |
| Richard Cataggio (MNRCC) | Absent |
| Francis T. Corcoran (MNRCC) | Absent |
| Orrin Getz (MNRCC) | Absent |
| Stuart Goldstein (NYCTRC) | Present |
| Christopher Greif (NYCTRC) | Present |
| William Guild (NYCTRC) | Absent |
| Marisol Halpern (NYCTRC) | Virtual |
| Sharon King Hoge (NYCTRC) | Virtual |
| Trudy L. Mason (NYCTRC) | Absent |
| Scott R. Nicholls (NYCTRC) | Absent |
| Bryan Peranzo (LIRRCC) | Absent |
| Marilyn N. Poterson (LIRRCC) | Virtual |
| Larry Rubinstein (LIRRCC) | Absent |
| Burton M. Strauss, Jr. (NYCTRC)  Christy Tolbert (LIRRCC)  Walter Zullig (MNRCC) | Virtual  Absent  Virtual |

**Staff Attendance**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Lisa Daglian (Executive Director) | Present |
| Bradley Brashears (Planning Manager)  Jessica Spezio (Administrative Assistant) | Present  Present |
| Shaul Picker (Research Intern) | Present |

**Non-member Attendance**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Affiliation** |
| Janno Lieber  Juliette Michaelson  John McCarthy  Cate Contino  David Stackel  Peter Ramos | Acting Chair & CEO MTA  Office of the Acting CEO/Chair  Office of the Acting CEO/Chair  New York City Transit  MTA Press Office  Metro-North Railroad |
| Andy Pollack  Andrew Kurzweil  Kara Gurl  Ron Troy  Felicia Park-Rogers  Dave Colon  Alfonso Castillo  Kevin Duggan  David Meyer | Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  TSTC  Streetsblog  Newsday  amNY  NY Post |
|  |  |

|  |
| --- |
| ***Approval of agenda for September 9, 2021 meeting***  ***Approval of minutes for June 3, 2021 meeting***  **PCAC Chair’s Report and LIRRCC Chair’s Report:**  G. Bringmann: In terms of MTA Board changes, all Cuomo appointees are holdovers until or if Governor Hochul decides to appoint replacements; all will be subject to NYS Senate approval. The Cuomo plan to separate the Board Chairman & CEO positions is probably now dead in the water. Certain proposed MTA Capital Projects, which have yet to be started (such as the new 8 track station immediately south of the existing Penn Station) may be put on hold until the new Governor, Kathy Hochul, has had the chance to review/analyze them.  On Wednesday evening September 1, and Thursday morning September 2, the MTA dealt with a historic rain event and shut down all services for a number of hours. Long Island was not hit as hard by the storms as other parts of the region were. Service was restored on most branches over the course of the morning, between 4 a.m. and 6:45 a.m. We had another situation last week on Thursday, which cut down service on the Port Washington Branch for most of the day.  Despite our best efforts, and the involvement of Senate Majority Leader Chuck Schumer, no progress has been made by the federal government regarding releasing monies tied up in WageWorks accounts held by thousands of our commuters.  The process to establish congestion pricing here in New York City has commenced and a number of hearings regarding this issue will soon be upcoming, starting September 23.  The PCAC is working on getting the Freedom Ticket adopted and a presentation regarding  this will be made later in this meeting. In addition, staff is also working on developing a more user-friendly website and we will receive a presentation on that later in the meeting as well.  L. Daglian: We have two new staff people. Jessica Spezio, our new Admin, joined us three weeks ago. Kara Gurl will be our communications and research associate; she will be joining us on September 16.  J. Spezio: My name is Jessica Spezio. I am the new administrative assistant here at PCAC. Prior to taking this position, I was a NYC Transit subway conductor for 2.5 years. |
| G. Bringmann: Capital projects, such as Third Track, East Side Access, Elmont Station, and Penn Station Concourse are progressing nicely. I had the opportunity to tour ESA with a couple of MTA Board members, as well as the Penn Station concourse work with Lisa and Larry Rubinstein, and was impressed with the progress on both occasions.  G. Bringmann: The LIRRCC received a request from the Connecticut Commuters Council, which represents riders on the New Haven Branch of Metro North, to join forces with them to see what can be done to increase mask compliance. Unfortunately, over the last couple of months, a greater percentage of riders are not wearing masks despite the MTA’s announcement blitz and ad campaign. We will be working with them to see how this can best be accomplished.  G. Bringmann: A number of Long Island business groups, including the LIA, have signed on to a letter to the MTA Chairman requesting that the Yaphank train station be relocated to a site closer to the Brookhaven National Laboratory. There are currently three sites under consideration, but this is pretty much a “back burner” issue for Capital Construction.  G. Bringmann: The LIRR is expecting a significant bump in ridership this month as New York City schools open, with a large number of commuting teachers returning, and many businesses are starting to recall workers to their offices at least two or three times a week basis. How much of a bump remains to be seen.  G. Bringmann: The LIRRCC has called on the LIRR and MTA to implement new ticket types to address the new commuting patterns of many of our riders, in particular a 20-trip peak ticket reflecting a discount of a similar percentage to a standard monthly. Indications are that management is receptive to just such a ticket. In the interim, the LIRR continues having off-peak fares in effect at all times.  C. Greif: There is a Suffolk County farm group that has gotten a lot of people going to Yaphank. The problem is that the Greenpoint train does not run frequently. Also, people say it is very hard to get there. It will be a problem for them if the station gets moved.  LIRR is doing mask force during the morning and evening rush hours, starting yesterday and continuing for a week and a half. We need to spread the word on this.  ***Guest Speaker: Janno Lieber, Acting Chair and CEO, MTA ( Video 11:11)***  L. Daglian: We would love to be able to support you in the welcome back campaign that is going to be coming out. We are not the 38 strong that we should be, and our voices are loud so please let us help you and all riders.  J. Lieber: As for our Board Meeting next week we made it so people can participate remotely or in person. There has been confusion over whether the Open Meetings Law is in effect or not. We want everyone to feel empowered to participate.  C. Greif: You mentioned masks. I have been on mask force in Coney Island, and I think the problem is, and Transit 34 is backing this up, and we see people who will not put on a mask, or say they don’t have to wear one since they are vaccinated or do not like it. In addition, there is a concern in the disability and senior community that the monthlies are supposed to be discontinued or changed.  J. Lieber: The goal on this phase of fare policy is to focus on new patterns of travel. We want to do incentives to bring people back, but it will require a bit more study to initiate a fare policy that will sustain. On masks, when you use a public space, you agree to the rules of behavior set collectively. We try to persuade them and try to reinforce it with more law enforcement visibility.  G. Bringmann: We can have police officers on a train just spot-checking every once in a while. If commuters see someone getting hit with a $50 ticket, they will be more likely to put their masks on. You can be more selective about where to deploy their people.  J. Lieber: The railroad really did a great job after the storms. The Port Washington Line was back in operation for the evening. I was out there with the Governor, and there was a serious washout. All the ballast was roiled up, switches had debris in them and had to be cleaned out, and that was a relatively manageable one.  G. Bringmann: It helped that the MTA is getting a better feel of handling social media. On the day of the storm, there was a picture of a patrol train in front of a tree that was down, and it mentioned this was why they were running. You had people seeing trains passing by and wondering why they could not get on. Things like that explain what you were doing and why.  S. Goldstein: Could you share with the group anything being done on the power backup situation at the operations center, where we had a failure?  J. Lieber: We are in the middle of working that through. It is premature for me to get into it.  **NYCTRC Chair’s Report:**  A. Albert: Ida brought torrents of water into the system. We need more pumps and inflatable bladders, which can be put into effect quickly. They also need to look into third-party water getting into the system. Craig Cipriano is now in charge of New York City Transit. Frank Annicaro, who was in the maintenance department at buses, is now the acting head of buses. We got a tour of Pitkin Yard of the R211 fleet.  As you have likely seen on transit apps and electronic signs, as much service is being run as can be run with the crews available, which has affected several lines. We have asked what was being done to speed up the hiring. They have said they are speeding up the process of hiring train operators from 8 to 5 or 6 months and want to make sure it is safe.  A. Albert: The only complaint I have had about the storm was communication in the subway. When I came in on Thursday to catch the E train and waited for a while, finally someone told me there was no E train. There was no signage posted in the station.  C. Greif: There were so many errors. It had a B train running as the Q. There is no communication. Metro-North and the LIRR were giving better accessibility reroutes. There was no cross-honoring on the Queens Boulevard Line until later in the afternoon.  L. Daglian: Shaul, in the chat, shared a website that shows where the service is running. The MTA’s apps should get you the information. I shouldn’t need five apps on my phone to get what is the right time in the schedule and should not have to keep changing them to get the one that is most accurate.  C. Greif: That is what we said in the last technology meeting. There needs to be one app that has the whole transit system, including Access-a-Ride. |
| **MNRCC Chair’s Report:**  R. Glucksman: Lisa and I received an invitation to join Acting MTA Chair & CEO Janno Lieber and Metro-North President Rinaldi, along with federal, state and local officials on August 10, to celebrate the completion of work on the Third Avenue Bridge in Mount Vernon. This was the fourth bridge opened in Mount Vernon in three years. There are still two to be done: South Street and Fulton Avenue. The bridge which was replaced was 121 years old.  R. Glucksman: CTDOT issued new schedules effective July 26 for its Shore Line East, which operates between New Haven and New London, and the Hartford Line, which along with Amtrak, serves stations between New Haven and Springfield, MA.  R. Glucksman: Metro-North’s Hudson Line really suffered from the storm. Hurricane Ida caused complete service suspension for the railroad on September 2, 2021, and select service resumed on September 3, 2021.  R. Glucksman: July 30 was the last day at the MTA for Chairman Pat Foye and Interim NYCT President Sarah Feinberg. Because the New York State Legislature was no longer in session, and the Assembly did not act on now former-Governor Cuomo’s proposal to split the job of CEO and Board Chair, he appointed MTA C&D President Janno Lieber as Acting MTA Chairman and CEO. In turn, CEO Lieber announced that NYCT Bus Chief Craig Cipriano would become NYCT Interim President and Acting Executive Vice President of Subways Demetrius Crichlow was promoted to Senior Vice President, Subways.  On August 10, Governor Cuomo announced that he would resign effective August 24. Lieutenant Governor Kathy Hochul became the governor.  R. Glucksman: On August 29, Metro-North restored weekend service to 70 percent of pre-pandemic levels, and the following day, weekday service went to 83 percent of pre-pandemic levels. In comparison, CTDOT resumed full service on its Shore Line East and Hartford Lines, which connect with Metro-North in New Haven back on July 26. After reviewing these schedules I was dissatisfied with many changes that were made on the Hudson Line and notified Metro-North of those issues.  *Presentation: Freedom Ticket Phase II: Now, More than Ever!*  L. Daglian: We are thrilled to give you this sneak peek. We are looking at making the release on September 22. Bradley has been working on this for two years. This came out of Freedom Ticket, which was implemented as Atlantic Ticket, which was developed by the New York City Transit Riders Council.  S. Goldstein: When East Side Access opens, and the Atlantic Branch is relegated to a shuttle, should we reconsider the price?  B. Brashears: We haven’t gotten there yet. They have not made any announcements officially that it is going to happen.  A. Albert: I have spoken to Phil Eng about service plans once East Side Access opens, and I believe there will continue to be through service during rush hours, with shuttle service during the off-peak.  R. Glucksman: When I was a chair, I think we passed a PCAC resolution asking them not to implement a shuttle service.  L. Daglian: In terms of the short- and long-term recommendations, Janno noted that some of the changes in fare policy would need to be signed off on by the Board. Anything permanent would need board approval and fare hearings, but pilot programs could be implemented, like Atlantic Ticket.  Peter Ramos of Metro-North in the chat suggested that a better comparison, instead of comparing Burnside Avenue vs. Morris Heights on Metro-North would be to compare Williams Bridge with Gun Hill Road or Fordham MNR vs. Fordham Road on the subway.  B. Brashears: There are many examples to choose from. Morris Heights was chosen since it and three other Hudson Line stations are the furthest away from subway connections.  M. Halpern: I appreciate that you use Burnside as an example due to the topography of the Bronx. There are many hills in the western part of the Bronx. Freedom Ticket would also mitigate parking concerns at the four new stations, which will not be built with parking.  B. Brashears: We have long said that the four new stations are prime locations for implementing the program.  *Presentation: PCAC Website*  ***Old Business:***  L. Daglian: There will be ten virtual meetings for Central Business District tolling that are broken up by different areas. It would be great if our members from various areas could speak.  S. Hoge: I got on the N at three in the morning, and there were 3-4 people asleep in each car. Is this not being monitored anymore?  A. Albert: It is being monitored. It has subsided from the high six-seven months ago, but it is still too high. We have spoken with Transit and the Bowery Residents Committee.  ***New Business: None*** |
| ***Adjourned*** |

**This meeting was conducted via Zoom Conference Call:** [Zoom Video](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aHXpKlEfn-Q&list=PLDXH0sqF0KIgkDW3DWiHZsUF6MGc2kAtg&index=33)

The meeting was adjourned at 2:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa Daglian

Executive Director