



# PCAC

PERMANENT CITIZENS  
ADVISORY COMMITTEE TO THE MTA

## Meeting Minutes of

### March 3, 2022

A meeting of the Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA (PCAC) was convened at 12:00 noon on March 3, 2022 on the 20<sup>th</sup> floor, Conf. Room #4 at 2 Broadway, New York, NY 10004 and on Zoom.

#### Member Attendance

Gerard Bringmann (Chair)	Present
Andrew Albert (Vice Chair)	Present
Randolph Glucksman (Vice Chair)	Present
Francena Amparo (MNRCC)	Absent
Richard Cataggio (MNRCC)	Absent
Rosalind Clay Carter (MNRCC)	Present
Francis T. Corcoran (MNRCC)	Present
Orrin Getz (MNRCC)	Absent
Stuart Goldstein (NYCTRC)	Present
Peter Gorry (LIRCC)	Absent
Christopher Greif (NYCTRC)	Present
William Guild (NYCTRC)	Absent
Marisol Halpern (NYCTRC)	Present
Karen D. Hamilton (NYCTRC)	Present
Cicely Harris (NYCTRC)	Present
Sharon King Hoge (NYCTRC)	Present
Trudy L. Mason (NYCTRC)	Present
Scott R. Nicholls (NYCTRC)	Absent
Bryan Peranzo (LIRRCC)	Absent
Larry Rubinstein (LIRRCC)	Present
Michael Stanton (MNRCC)	Absent
Burton M. Strauss, Jr. (NYCTRC)	Present
Christy Tolbert (LIRRCC)	Absent
Walter Zullig (MNRCC)	Present

#### Staff Attendance

Lisa Daglian (Executive Director)	Present
Bradley Brashears (Planning Manager)	Present
Kara Gurl (Research & Comm Associate)	Present
Jessica Spezio (Administrative Assistant)	Present
Shaul Picker (Research Intern)	Present

#### Non-member Attendance

<u>Name</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>
Jamie Torres-Springer	MTA C&D
Sean Fitzpatrick	MTA C&D

PCAC MINUTES

Cathy Li Cate Contino	MTA C&D NYCT Govern. & Comm. Relations
Andrew Kurzweil Ron Troy William Sanford David Kupferberg Lenny Picker Ray Raimundi Kevin Duggan Jim Katzenberg Isabel Kraut Leslie Boghosian Robert Paley Shula Warren Rocio Zumaya Sara Bahri Linda Henniger	Concerned citizen Concerned citizen Concerned citizen Concerned citizen Concerned citizen MTA Press Office amNY Concerned citizen Concerned citizen Concerned citizen MTA TOD CCM Gale Brewer Concerned citizen MTA Accessibility Vision LI

***Approval of agenda for March 3, 2022 meeting***  
***Approval of minutes for December 9, 2021 meeting***

**PCAC Chair’s Report:**

- We would like to welcome our new members: Cicely Harris on the NYCTRC; Peter Gorry on LIRRCC; and Mike Stanton and Rosalind Clay Carter on MNRCC. Unfortunately, we also received word that Marilyn Poterson will be tendering her resignation and we will be looking to replace her, not just on the LIRRCC, but on the PCAC Executive Board as well. Needless to say, we will continue to work on filling all of our open council positions.
- C. Harris: Hello. I’m Cicely and I am the first deputy Commissioner for the New York State Division of Human Rights. I’m also the chair of Manhattan community board 10.
- R. Glucksman: What lines do you ride?
- C. Harris: I ride the A, B, C and D for traveling and to get to work as well.
- K. Hamilton: Hello, I’m Karen and I’m an urban planner and I’m also a transit advocate with Rider’s Alliance and I’m happy to be here.
- R. Clay Carter: Hi, I’m Rosalind. My professional career has been in human resources, and I’m a resident of Larchmont. I also volunteer in many civic areas and I’m happy to be here.
- L. Daglian: Our other members, Michael Stanton and Peter Gorry, have prior commitments and are unable to attend today. Unfortunately, Marilyn Poterson has informed us that she will no longer be able to serve, and we want to thank her and wish her the best.
- PCAC has received approval to fill the vacant Associate Director’s position and interviews took place last week. We hope to be announcing the new AD within the next few weeks.
- PCAC staff has been working on getting our new website up and running, as well as getting our 2020-21 Annual Reports issued (there will be one combination report).

## PCAC MINUTES

### 3

- The commuter rails resumed peak price tickets earlier this week (March 1<sup>st</sup>), but at the urging of PCAC, there are new discount ticket types available for our riders. We'd like to thank Andrew Albert for representing PCAC on the MTA Board Committee that explored and recommended the new ticket type pilot programs.
- PCAC requested a meeting with the MTA IG to get an update on their investigation into the organizations that deal with the homeless throughout the MTA system, but we were asked to wait until the new (permanent) MTA IG is appointed. In the interim, we are hoping that Governor Hochul's initiative to send teams of social workers into the system will help lessen the problems that riders are experiencing with the homeless at this time, as well as getting these unfortunate individuals the assistance that they require.
- We testified at the NYS Assembly/NYS Senate's Joint Legislative Hearing on Transportation in support of transit that's safe, reliable, and affordable – including new dedicated operating revenue streams such as reconfiguring the amount of funding transit receives from gas and petroleum tax money, versus how much highways gets; continuing the important building and rebuilding work the MTA has underway; and greater transparency. The full testimony is available on the website at [pcac.org](http://pcac.org). We have also been invited to testify at the upcoming City Council hearing on Transit and Equity.

#### **LIRRCC Chair's Report:**

- As most of you know by now, Phil Eng recently submitted his resignation as the President of the LIRR. Phil did an outstanding job during his four years at the helm of the LIRR, and we wish him nothing but the very best in his retirement. Cathy Rinaldi has been tasked with running both the LIRR & Metro-North until a suitable replacement can be found for President Eng.
- The LIRR mega projects (East Side Access & Third Track) continue to run on schedule for their anticipated December 2022 completions.
- The homeless/panhandler situation at Penn Station and on the LIRR continue to be a concern and we will continue working with the MTA and other appropriate agencies to try and come to a resolution. We have requested a meeting with the Penn Station team to try and come up with solutions to the many problems there that are only worsened by the many different agencies involved, particularly in overseeing safety and public spaces.
- The shooting in Ronkonkoma was the first on a LIRR train since 1993 and was jarring to many of us. We've called for more enforcement on trains and closer collaboration with local law enforcement and community organizations, including those who work to get illegal guns off the streets.

#### **NYCTRC Chair's Report:**

- Since the Mayor has announced his plan to help remove the homeless from our system, we have seen a 200 percent increase in crime. They're not all violent crimes but many of them are thefts and any crime is too much crime. This is obviously a work in progress, and we are hopeful that crime will drop.

## PCAC MINUTES

### 4

- The tracking being done by the Track intrusion team is stating that some of the people are actually choosing to go down to the tracks and some of them are being pushed. None of which is good for service or the individual.
- The pilot program for platform doors will be set up at three stations. The stations are Times Square on the 7 line, The 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue station on the L line, and the Sutphin Archer stop on the E line. This is not the solution, especially when only 40 out of 472 stations can support new platform doors. We also have various car types, so the car doors won't line up accordingly across the system.
- Ridership is back on the rise and that's a great thing. I have been on many standing-room-only trains recently.

### **MNRCC Chair's Report:**

- During our recent meetings we have talked about my discussions with Metro-North regarding the amount of time that trips are taking, and some service improvements are now coming.
- At the February 22<sup>nd</sup> Joint Metro-North and Long Island Committees Meeting, President Cathy Rinaldi announced the March 2022 schedule changes for East-of-Hudson lines. Basically, weekday service is being increased from 82% to 89% of pre-COVID levels.

**Guest Speaker: Jamie Torres-Springer: Chief Development Officer, MTA C&D**  
**Presentation Link: [https://youtu.be/VgcpCbd4\\_5Y?t=1130](https://youtu.be/VgcpCbd4_5Y?t=1130)**

T. Mason: I have two questions if I may? Since Chair Janno Lieber previously worked in your position, will he continue to work closely with you? My second question is, as a result of the \$6 billion dollars given to the MTA, will the funds be used for any specific projects?

J. Torres-Springer: The Chair and I have a long-standing relationship and we will continue to work closely together. For the second part of your question, we will be using \$3.5 billion dollars for capital projects and the rest of the bill is for discretionary grants. We have a team that is handling all of the grant notices.

C. Greif: I would like to request that lighting/camera safety be considered in the updating of new accessible elevators in the stations.

J. Torres-Springer: This is very much a priority for us. We are reviewing all options when updating elevators and on new ones being installed.

A. Albert: You mentioned track intrusion and how they couldn't differentiate between inanimate and animate intrusions. We were told by the Track Intrusion Technology Team that using ultra-wideband they could differentiate between a person and, for example, a rat.

## PCAC MINUTES

### 5

J. Torres-Springer: Ultra-wideband is one of the technologies we will look at and we have other technologies as well. We have received 28 responses, and a full team is looking into the track intrusion options.

K. Hamilton: I just want to bring up the various levels of accessibility. I know we have discussed ramps and escalators in other meetings, but there is a lot of emphasis on this and the needs of the specific elevator and or ramp use. There are different levels of mobility issues and I think that needs to be considered.

J. Torres-Springer: Yes – those are very good points. Elevator reliability is very important, and part of the new approach we are taking is to make sure we are building in a way that yields reliable elevators. We also put service contracts into place at the same time. We have a new private-practice-partnership to monitor 13 new station elevators and 5 new rehabilitation centers, so 18 in total. Vertical transportation is also important. It's a very helpful comment.

L. Daglian: I was glad to see equity and accessibility shared a slide. Do you have any updates on the East River tunnels? Also, on Port Jefferson, is double tracking an option, or are the BEMUs another option?

J. Torres-Springer: I will definitely have to get back to you on the East River tunnels dates. I know it was agreed on by Amtrak but not sure when it'll start. As for the Port Jefferson project, it's going to be one of those projects you'll see in our regional long-term planning thinking. It will then have to be evaluated before it goes into the next capital plan.

B. Brashears: PCAC staff is doing a capital program deep-dive analysis for a resiliency and sustainability report. We know that you all are heavily looking into this, and we would like to know from your perspective, what are the priority projects that must be undertaken?

J. Torres-Springer: We are working on that. We recreated a task force after Hurricane Ida with the city agencies and they have revisited 150 stations that were previously reviewed; that work has been very helpful. We have longer-term issues as well, it's not as simple as saying we need more sewer pipes.

A. Albert: Water intrusion from third parties can be an added issue.

B. Strauss: What is the status of the building facilities for recharging buses? I understand this is a big project, but how far along are you or do still have to go?

J. Torres-Springer: Yes, this is a complex project, but our goal is by 2040 to have a zero-emissions bus fleet. We need to buy more buses and to take into consideration the demand on the need for them to be made as well. We do have a facility on the west side that we use to charge some buses, and we have the Jamaica yard facility.

S. Picker: In 2019, the FRA issued new alternate crashworthiness standards for rolling stock, allowing lighter off-the-shelf European rolling stock to be used. Are you considering making use of the new regulations for the upcoming M9A procurement, given that this would increase competition as you would have more manufacturers entering the American market and as trains

## PCAC MINUTES

6

would be lighter and would significantly reduce costs and wear on infrastructure? If not, why not?

J. Torres-Springer: I have to admit I'm not familiar with it, but I'd have to look into that.

D. Kupferberg: What are your thoughts regarding Penn Station Access for the Hudson line via the west side?

J. Torres-Springer: My thoughts are that a lot of these expansion proposals sound great and it's just a question of cost and benefits and how does this look in our evaluation. I'm very pleased that we have that process underway, because it's going to allow us to very transparently go out there and look at all these different options.

### ***Old Business:***

S. King Hoge: It's nice that we have additional police officers but I would prefer if we can have them stand by the turnstiles or on the platforms, instead of standing around chatting with each other.

A. Albert: People have sent me similar comments to what you are stating. You can send me badge numbers and their locations, and I can report these issues.

R. Glucksman: If the members want to help with reporting what they see, they will need to get a car number, station and then send it over to you.

L. Rubinstein: I think we should be sending a letter to Senator Schumer for dropping the ball on the WageWorks issue where so many people lost out on their money.

L. Daglian: I emailed them yesterday and they said it was still in the rewrite office.

R. Clay Carter: Do we know how much the aggregate amount of what it would be? The larger the number the more attention this can get.

L. Rubinstein: We tried to figure out a number, it's somewhere in the millions. It's definitely a nationwide issue, this is not only in New York. It's a company that can take out money pre-tax for transportation services.

L. Daglian: It's not specific to any transit mode. It's a privately held company that was Transit Check that turned to WageWorks. There have been op-ed's on this ongoing issue.

C. Greif: Changing the subject here and addressing the increase of homeless people in Penn Station. I've heard people saying they would rather go to Atlantic Terminal instead of commuting through Penn Station.

A. Albert: Yes, I agree. They have to get them off the trains, but they need to provide services to them. The new program just started so we have to give it time.

## PCAC MINUTES

7

T. Mason: Mayor Adams has said this is his priority and I'm hopeful that this program will work.

K. Hamilton: This is a comment about safety issues for pedestrians that are walking in stations and people on scooters who zip on by.

A. Albert: I think it's a major issue and we should have the police address that. I will be bringing that issue up.

L. Daglian: The issue of scooters and electric bikes has come up on the LIRRCC meeting as well. They aren't supposed to be on peak trains, and they are. We should have more enforcement focusing on these issues.

A. Albert: People should be walking their scooters on platforms not riding them on platforms or in the stations.

K. Hamilton: Will you be testifying at the Transit Equity Hearing on Monday?

L. Daglian: Yes, I am testifying. I wanted to hear Jamie's presentation first. We are looking at a host of issues including Fair Fares, accessibility, and bus redesigns. If you have any suggestions, please email them to me.

W. Sanford: Is there a way we can request to have printed schedules in the stations again? I have no access to a computer.

A. Albert: It takes time and money to print schedules and with changes occurring so frequent they wouldn't always be up-to-date. You can make a call to check the schedule in advance, if you can't check online or from a smart phone.

R. Clay Carter: Metro-North isn't the only one that has done away with paper schedules as Amtrak has as well. How current is Google maps for train schedules?

A. Albert: I have to say I use the app, Underway, and that is pretty accurate. I can't say Google is accurate as I've seen it's not as accurate as some of the other third-party apps.

K. Hamilton: They used to post timetables in the stations. Do they still do that?

A. Albert: I don't believe they do. Randy/Gerry do you have any input on how people can find out time schedules or if they plan on printing them again?

R. Glucksman: I received an email from Metro-North about my request on whether or not they were going to print timetables. The email says they do not plan on printing paper schedule going forward.

### **Website Review:**

B. Brashears: The new site has been up for a few months now. Please take a look in your spare time and let us know if there are any issues or updates you'd like to see. If you haven't already done so, please send us a picture and your updated bio.

## PCAC MINUTES

8

### ***New Business:***

R. Clay Carter: As we build budgets, is there any way of knowing what the projected numbers would be with a hybrid schedule of people returning?

A. Albert: An updated report on projected ridership is in the works. We were actually beating the ridership report that was previously reported by McKinsey before Omicron hit. Last week we hit four days of over 4 million so that is a good sign.

L. Rubinstein: In my opinion, the hybrid schedule will be the new way going forward. It'll probably be years before a full-time work force goes back to what we considered normal. I also think the rising gas prices will work in the favor of people taking transportation as opposed to driving.

L. Daglian: The Mayor and the Governor are pushing people to come back into the offices. As congestion pricing moves forward, it will get the people who drive in off the roads and back on the trains.

S. Goldstein: Can we have a briefing on the new service plan with East Side Access approaching?

G. Bringmann: I don't think there is a plan in effect yet.

B. Brashears: They are in development, but we don't know how far along they are. They should also be thinking of ways to educate the riders on using the new facilities.

S. Goldstein: What information is available when you click these QR codes on the flyers regarding the new fares? We continue to stress the importance of transparency but the information being given isn't clear, including and when is it considered peak time and off peak?

S. King Hoge: Also, to add to this, there can be a sign that says there is no nighttime service. When is it considered nighttime? Time schedules should be listed specific.

L. Daglian: As for the peak times and fares, the times are different for different railroads. If we are asking for consistency, which times are we going to use, and can they both be the same going forward?

### ***Adjourned***

**YouTube link:** [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VgcpCbd4\\_5Y](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VgcpCbd4_5Y)

### **Action Items:**

Follow-up with Jamie Torres-Springer about East River Tunnel dates.

The meeting was adjourned at 2:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

*PCAC MINUTES*

9

Lisa Daglian  
Executive Director