A meeting of the Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA (PCAC) was convened at 12:00 noon on December 8, 2022 on the 20th floor, Conf. Room #4 at 2 Broadway, New York, NY 10004 and on Zoom.

**Member Attendance**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Gerard Bringmann (Chair)  Andrew Albert (Vice Chair) | Present  Present |
| Randolph Glucksman (Vice Chair) | Present |
| Francena Amparo (MNRCC) | Absent |
| Richard Cataggio (MNRCC)  Rosalind Clay Carter (MNRCC) | Absent  Present |
| Francis T. Corcoran (MNRCC) | Present |
| Stuart Goldstein (NYCTRC)  Peter Gorry (LIRRCC) | Present  Absent |
| Christopher Greif (NYCTRC) | Present |
| William Guild (NYCTRC) | Absent |
| Marisol Halpern (NYCTRC)  Karen D. Hamilton (NYCTRC)  Cicely Harris (NYCTRC) | Present  Absent  Present |
| Sharon King Hoge (NYCTRC) | Present |
| Trudy L. Mason (NYCTRC) | Present |
| Scott R. Nicholls (NYCTRC) | Present |
| Bryan Peranzo (LIRRCC) | Absent |
| Larry Rubinstein (LIRRCC)  Michael Stanton (MNRCC) | Present  Present |
| Burton M. Strauss, Jr. (NYCTRC)  Christy Tolbert (LIRRCC)  Walter Zullig (MNRCC) | Present  Present  Present |
|  |  |

**Staff Attendance**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Lisa Daglian (Executive Director)  Liam Blank (Associate Director) | Present  Absent |
| Kara Gurl (Research & Comm Associate)  Jessica Spezio (Administrative Assistant) | Present  Present |
|  |  |

**Non-member Attendance**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Name**  Carl Esposito  Jim Katzenberger  Michael Shiffer  Sean Fitzpatrick  Michael Gilbert  Will Schwartz  Elisa Van der Linde  Eric Wollman  Jim Compton  Mark Lebow  Lenny Picker  Andrew Buder  David Kupferberg  William Sanford Jr.  Andrew Kurzweil  Mike Howard  Kayla Shults  Ron Troy  Bruce Hein | **Affiliation**  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  MTA C&D  MTA C&D  Concerned citizen  MTA Gov’t & Comm. Relations  MNR  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  MNR  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  MTA Press office  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| ***Approval of agenda for December 8, 2022 meeting***  ***Approval of minutes for September 8, 2022 meeting – Tabled for discussion/amendments***  **PCAC Chair’s Report/ LIRRCC Chair’s Report:**  ***January and February 2023 Chairs’ Reports included in separate document***  **December- LIRRCC Chair’s Reports**  • East Side Access is still on track to begin service by the end of this month. The MTA is in the process of conducting final tests and securing approval from different agencies (such as FDNY) before announcing an official start date. The MTA is ensuring the process is completed as soon as possible.  • Work on Penn Station is progressing according to plan, and several tenants have already signed leases.  • With the city’s plan to develop Willets Point, we have increased our efforts to make the Mets-Willets Point station accessible, preferably using the Elmont/UBS Station model of 90% private funding. To this end, we are holding a series of meetings to discuss the matter.  **As for the PCAC:**  • We have hired our new Associate Director and he will be starting on December 8th – today We are also pushing Human Resources to post the other open positions as soon as possible.  • Now that the elections have been held (and an additional staff member is joining our team), we will be redoubling our efforts to fill the vacancies on all three of our Councils.  • We are strongly advocating for the MTA to establish a clear policy on battery and/or gas-powered scooters, etc. on our mass transit system. We have concerns not only about the powering devices, but also the size of some of these units, and where the line needs to be drawn.  • As is well known, the MTA is facing a financial cliff, and the PCAC will be closely monitoring this situation.  **NYCTRC Chair’s Report:**  1. **Ridership**: Ridership is still trending upwards, with weekends recovering pre-pandemic ridership faster than weekdays. Tuesdays through Thursdays continue to be the days of the week with the highest ridership, with lower ridership on Mondays and Fridays.  2. **Safety/Police Presence**: There are many more police officers around the system and announcements on trains letting riders know where police are on the platform. Safety has been improving, and while there is still some crime, apprehensions are happening faster.  3. **New accessible stations coming**: In 2023, fourteen more stations will have new or refurbished elevators, including Yankee Station 4/B/D, Junius Street 3, Church Avenue B/Q, Sheepshead Bay B/Q, Kings Highway F, and Borough Hall 2/3/4/5. [The full list of stations can be found here.](https://new.mta.info/press-release/mta-announces-accessibility-upgrades-multiple-subway-and-lirr-stations)  4. **Reduced fare OMNY**: OMNY for reduced fare riders is now available. Soon, we will start to see the installation of OMNY machines in stations. The MTA is announcing later today that station booth agents will be brought out of the booth and will have a new presence around stations to help riders with directions.  **MNRCC Chair’s Report:**  The MTA’s budget situation is dire, and Metro-North is looking at several efficiencies to reduce costs and develop best practices and common standards with the LIRR. At the November Board meeting, Cathy Rinaldi discussed utilizing data to identify opportunities to “modify weekday schedules” and “make targeted reductions on train set lengths” – we will closely monitor what this entails to guarantee that it does not mean service reductions. There will be a groundbreaking for the Penn Access project tomorrow, December 9th, at the Parkchester-Van Nest station.  **T. Mason**: I’m hearing there is still confusion about the $5 fee for OMNY card purchases. I’m requesting they have signs and advertising informing customers that the $5 fee is not applied to funds on the card or for fares.  **W. Sanford:** Are there plans to make the Borough Hall station R train level accessible?  **A. Albert:** The goal is to make that whole station accessible.  ***Vote:*** [***Open Meetings Law Resolution and Regulations***](https://pcac.org/about/bylaws/)***– Discussed/Approved***  In order to meet the requirements of the Open Meetings Law, PCAC members unanimously voted to approve a resolution requiring an in-person quorum with meetings held in publicly accessible locations in order for the Committee to take any actions at meetings. Lisa further explained that multiple in-person locations are permitted, and members should notify staff in advance if they plan to join a meeting remotely from a non-public location, so the location can be posted publicly. In extraordinary circumstances such as illness, members joining remotely from a non-public location may still take official action and count towards a quorum.  **Presentation:** Twenty-Year Needs Analysis and Comparative Evaluation Overview: Michael Shiffer, Sr. VP, Regional Planning, MTA C&D; Sean Fitzpatrick, Deputy Chief of Staff, Office of the President, MTA C&D; Will Schwartz, Deputy Chief, MTA Government and Community Relations.  **View presentation here:** <https://youtu.be/NuYPmIyMwC0?t=1538>  **R. Glucksman** I have a question about whether you have updates on three projects: the Midpoint Yard on the Port Jervis Line, the Secaucus Loop, and Third Track between Scarsdale and White Plains.    **W. Schwartz** On specific projects, the answer is going to be the same across the board— that right now, we are looking at them through the lens of comparative evaluation, and in the context of our 20 year needs. The status update for every project on the list is going to be the same, with the exception of a couple including the Interborough Express, which was playing catch up to some of these projects because of its later arrival.    **M. Shiffer** We are continuing to look at the improvements on the Port Jervis line, including passing sidings and Midpoint Yard.    **W. Schwartz** Unlike a significant number of these projects, some of elements of the Port Jervis capacity improvements have funding in the current 2020 to 2024 MTA capital program to help advance that conversation.    **M. Shiffer**  Third Track from White Plains to Scarsdale is being considered with the Harlem line upgrades. We’re looking at not only the third track, but also looking at it the necessary power in the signal infrastructure that needs to be put in place to make that work.    **T. Mason** How are you considering the costs or how these potential projects are going to be paid for, while you're doing this 20 year planning? Is there a parallel group of financial people doing the 20 year planning of how various things are going to be paid for? Will congestion pricing funding come into consideration for these projects?    **W. Schwartz** We're considering congestion pricing and all funding conversations. The way that that program is created by state law is first to drive funding for the current capital program. Any additional revenues available beyond what we need to raise $15 billion for this capital program can be applied to successor capital programs. We're having daily conversations about long-term financial planning for the agency, both on the operating and capital side of the program.    **S. Fitzpatrick** Our team is taking a comprehensive look across the MTA’s assets, our state of good repair needs, our system improvement needs and our normal replacement needs. Our goal as the planning wing of the MTA is to make sure that we have a sense of everything that needs to be done, so that can inform the difficult conversations that will need to be had about how to fund that. Right now, we're not letting dollar constraints dictate our sense of what the system needs.    **W. Schwartz** Before anything else happens, we need to make sure that we maintain state of good repair and tackle normal replacement that needs to happen throughout the system. And then, within the funding envelope that we have for the next capital program, what monies are available to look at some of the capacity projects and system expansion projects that the comparative evaluation process is looking at right now.    **S. Goldstein** Can you share some thoughts with us about how technology, if at all, is considered in the decision process, including with electrification needs?    **W. Schwartz** As we're talking about evaluating the system's assets and the fleet, as technology is evolving, we're going to look at other technologies beyond electric buses, but to see what other technology is out there for zero emission and to meet climate goals. That's part of that 20-year needs conversation, the long-range planning, and categorizing the asset needs.    **M. Shiffer** When we look at projects like the Interborough Express that include new modes, we are looking at modes that are zero emission. That underscores the analysis of all of the various projects.    **S. King Hoge** Do you have any idea what percentage of the entire list of potential projects would be able to be done?    **M. Shiffer** We're actually working to answer your question. We have to know how much these projects cost. And then once you know that, and once you know what your available funding envelope is, we will see what we have to work with. That will determine what we can and can't do on the list.    **C. Greif** It’s important that accessibility is prioritized in the next Capital Plan, including elevators and ramps.    **W. Schwartz**  Accessibility is definitely a big part of the 20-year needs process. We'll certainly bring that feedback back as well.    **S. Fitzpatrick** Accessibility is a great example of core infrastructure projects, where we account for how to make the next round of accessibility upgrades, meeting our obligation under the accessibility settlement, and projects like the ones you mention.    **A. Albert** Where did your list of potential projects for comparative evaluation come from? Was it MTA planning, advocates, or elected officials? What was the genesis of that list?    **W. Schwartz** All of the above. Some come from internal interest, some come from external interest including, elected officials, individual stakeholders, and community groups. For the first time in a long time, we have a centralized look at all of these different projects and are putting them through an equal analysis. It's an opportunity for us to bring a number of conversations together and put them through the same exact evaluation process. And then, we can have a uniform analysis that we can then explain to external stakeholders about why they may or may not be seeing them move forward, compared to other projects.    **L. Daglian** As you look at the at the pot of money that's left over, is there a percentage that's that overarchingly allocated to each of the operating systems?    **W. Schwartz** One of the metrics for evaluation is geographic equity. There is not an exact number breakdown, but geographic equity is a priority and is certainly one of the things that gets considered, including how broad the benefit will be and how much the investment will give us a return across the region.  ***Discussion: Fiscal Cliff and PCAC Recommendations***  Lisa discussed the financial challenges faced by the MTA, including a potential $600 million deficit in 2023 and a larger deficit in the coming years. She emphasized the need for city, state, and federal leaders to view public transportation as an essential service and find alternate ways to support operating funds instead of relying heavily on farebox revenue, which is not sustainable in the long term. Lisa mentioned proposals that will be put forward legislatively in the coming weeks and asked for input on other ideas to address the MTA's financial situation, as well as 2023 goals and priorities for PCAC.  **T. Mason:** Janno has brought up a new project that needs to be prioritized and is likely to be very expensive, involving redesigning the turnstile. That project is a capital expense, but it still needs to be taken into consideration for budgeting purposes.  ***Old Business:***  **T. Mason:** Can we send a letter stating that we are requesting signs or a notice that “masks are strongly encouraged” on buses and subways?  **C. Greif:** Can we submit pictures to the staff from events that we attend so it can be posted on our website? It’s a good way to show what we have been doing and the events we have attended.  **S. Hoge:** The Southeast Metro-North station is very confusing when transferring. It needs more signs and announcements telling which train is going, North or South.  ***New Business:***  None   |  | | --- | | **Adjourned** |   **YouTube link:** [**https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NuYPmIyMwC0**](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NuYPmIyMwC0)  **Action Items:**  **None**  The meeting was adjourned at 2:00 PM.  Respectfully submitted,  Lisa Daglian  Executive Director |
|  |
|  |