



PCAC

PERMANENT CITIZENS
ADVISORY COMMITTEE TO THE MTA

Meeting Minutes of

June 1, 2023

Per Open Meeting Law requirements, an in-person meeting of the Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee (PCAC) was convened at 2 Broadway and at one additional publicly accessible location, at 940 Rose Avenue, Bethesda, Maryland 20852, as noticed, at 12:00 pm on Thursday, June 1, 2023. Members of the public and Council members unable to attend were present via Zoom.

Member Attendance

Gerard Bringmann (Chair)	Present
Andrew Albert (Vice Chair)	Present
Randolph Glucksman (Vice Chair)	Absent
Francena Amparo (MNRCC)	Present— virtual
Richard Cataggio (MNRCC)	Absent
Rosalind Clay Carter (MNRCC)	Present— Maryland location
Francis T. Corcoran (MNRCC)	Present— virtual
Stuart Goldstein (NYCTRC)	Present
Peter Gorry (LIRRCC)	Absent
Christopher Greif (NYCTRC)	Present
Marisol Halpern (NYCTRC)	Absent
Karen D. Hamilton (NYCTRC)	Present
Cicely Harris (NYCTRC)	Absent
Sharon King Hoge (NYCTRC)	Absent
Trudy L. Mason (NYCTRC)	Present
Scott R. Nicholls (NYCTRC)	Absent
Bryan Peranzo (LIRRCC)	Present— virtual
Larry Rubinstein (LIRRCC)	Present— virtual
Michael Stanton (MNRCC)	Present
Burton M. Strauss, Jr. (NYCTRC)	Present
Christy Tolbert (LIRRCC)	Absent
Walter Zullig (MNRCC)	Present

Staff Attendance

Lisa Daglian (Executive Director)	Present
Kara Gurl (Planning & Advocacy Manager)	Present
Jessica Spezio (Administrative Assistant)	Absent
Ryan Leighton (Intern)	Present

Non-member Attendance

<u>Name</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>
John McCarthy	MTA
Jeremy Feigelson	MTA
Rachel Cohen	MTA
George Haikalis	Concerned citizen

PCAC MINUTES

2

Debra Greif	Concerned citizen
Patrick Scalise	MTA
David Kupferberg	Concerned citizen
William Stanford Jr.	Concerned citizen
Andrew Kurzweil	Concerned citizen
Mike Howard	Concerned citizen
Ron Troy	Concerned citizen
Jim Compton	Concerned citizen
Alex Marinides	Senator Liz Krueger's Office
Carl Perrera	Concerned citizen
Chris Boylan	Concerned citizen
Jim Katzenberg	Concerned citizen

Approval of agenda for June 1, 2023 meeting ***Approval of minutes for March 2, 2023 meeting***

PCAC/LIRRCC Chair's Report:

- The NYS State Legislature & Governor's Office has worked with the MTA to provide adequate funding so that we are no longer in jeopardy of falling off the infamous financial cliff. And not just for this budget, but the next few years.
- Part of that financial plan is the restoration of biennial fare increases. Fare Hearings will be scheduled to begin later this month and will probably be voted on in July. These increases will most likely take effect in September. Due to the generous package received from New York State, this year's increase will only be 4% instead of the originally proposed 5.5%
- It should be noted that a couple of discounted programs, the 20-trip commutation ticket and Atlantic Ticket, are in jeopardy of being lost. It is my recommendation that PCAC fight to keep both of these in place. We will also hear more about the fare review that the office undertook that can help inform our recommendations.
- Another part of the long-range financial plan is Congestion Pricing, which has recently gotten over a few hurdles, but is still over a year away from being implemented. This program will become a major contributor to the Capital Plan once in place. We anticipate the final FONSI in mid-to-late June.
- The MTA has announced the results of the Blue Ribbon Fare Evasion Panel and we look forward to seeing the recommendations being put into practice. Fare Evasion costs the MTA hundreds of millions of dollars a year in lost revenue.

PCAC MINUTES

3

- After much "encouragement" from the PCAC, the MTA has also adopted a policy regarding the use of PEV's within our transit system. We now look forward to a robust informational campaign to advise our ridership about the formalized rules & regulations.
- Regarding the LIRR, riders continue to express their displeasure with the schedule (and some crowding to/from Penn Station) since the implementation of Grand Central Madison service. While there were only the typical adjustments made for the "Summer Schedule" which just took effect, we are strongly encouraging the LIRR to make some major changes come this fall. First and foremost among these should be the restoration of timed connections at Jamaica.
- In order to assist us in making proper recommendations regarding the LIRR schedule, we have undertaken a survey of ridership. Kara will tell you more about the process (and when we plan to release the results) later in today's meeting.
- Another concern regarding the LIRR is the fact that the MTA has yet to release the contract for the new M-9a procurement. There are only about three dozen or so M-9's yet to be delivered from the original order, yet we're still seeing approximately 100 M-3's (which are at the limit of their useful lives) in service.
- Closing on a positive note, the LIRRCC has finally established a satellite office in Mineola, where we held our April & May council meetings.

MNRCC Chair's Report: (Presented by Lisa)

New train schedules will go into effect on the East-of-Hudson Lines on June 11.

Hudson Line

- Minor adjustments to three AM Peak trains to relieve congestion at Spuyten Duyvil
- Weekday trains to Poughkeepsie add 3 minutes for station platform work at Beacon and New Hamburg and adjacent-area trackwork
- Half-hourly weekend service resumes between GCT and Croton-Harmon with the completion of switch replacements in the Bronx
- Weekend trains to Poughkeepsie add 5 minutes for station platform work at Beacon and New Hamburg and adjacent-area trackwork

Harlem Line

- Minor adjustments to weekday off-peak trains to accommodate trackwork between Goldens Bridge and Brewster

New Haven Line

- All weekday Waterbury Branch trains will now stop at Stratford, CT
- Train 1472 from GCT to South Norwalk will be suspended, with stops between Stamford and Rowayton added to Train 1572
- Minor adjustments to weekend main-line trains and up to 3 minutes added for numerous trackwork projects.

PCAC MINUTES

4

Lisa gave an update on the potential cuts to Shore Line East and New Haven Line service proposed by Connecticut in the state budget. Lisa shared that we are working with the CT Commuter Rail Council to help prevent these cuts.

NYCTRC Chair's Report:

1. Ridership
2. Congestion Pricing update
3. Fare Increase
4. Budget update
5. Service increases

Stuart asked what our position on the removal of Atlantic Ticket would be and whether the MTA has shared how many people would potentially be impacted by the removal.

Lisa explained that we don't yet know what the fare change proposals will be but there will be a public comment period in June and the changes will be voted on in July's Board meeting. [Read more about the fare changes here.](#)

Presentation: Recommendations of the Blue Ribbon Payment Evasion Task Force Report (released 5/17/23) presented by Jeremy Feigelson, Special Counsel, MTA

View presentation with Q&A here: <https://youtu.be/mTxy8dgo1CI?t=1406>

Jeremy shared that the Blue Ribbon panel report was released two weeks ago, marking the start of efforts to communicate its findings to the public and initiate the implementation of recommendations proposed by the panel and the diverse expertise of the 16 panel members, including Lisa, who are professionals in fields including Transit, Social Justice, and Criminal Justice. The panel was noted for its enthusiastic transit user composition, as members introduced themselves based on their use of various transit services rather than their professional titles. The group worked diligently, conducting field research, analyzing data, and dedicating personal time and energy to the project, resulting in a comprehensive and impactful report. The recommendations focused on the four E's: education, equity, environment (design and technology), and enforcement. He encouraged members to read the panel's report and recommendations, [which can be found here.](#)

Chris mentioned the importance of accessibility and that slam gates are needed for entrance and exit of the stations.

Karen suggested making Fair Fares easier to enroll in to help with equity.

Jeremy mentioned the commuter rail ticket activation process and shared that the report addresses the issue of people waiting to activate their ticket until after boarding the train.

Presentation: Overview of the SFY 2024 Budget and what it means for the MTA and riders, and Congestion Pricing next steps by John McCarthy, Chief, External Relations

PCAC MINUTES

5

View presentation with Q&A here: <https://youtu.be/mTxy8dgo1CI?t=4014>

John thanked the PCAC and transit advocates for their help in achieving the budget, which fully funds the MTA now and over the next few years thanks to Governor Hochul and the state legislature after transit faced a major budget gap. He explained some of the new and additional funding streams that will be dedicated to the MTA, including an increase in the PMT within the city and funding for off-peak service increases. He added that ridership records continue to rise across the system, and explained that the MTA is continuing to work on public safety issues and fare evasion solutions. Lastly, John discussed congestion pricing and shared that the final EA and draft FONSI comment period ends on June 12th.

Trudy pointed out the work that PCAC has done since the beginning of discussions on congestion pricing, and asked if the MTA is prepared for litigation. John shared that the MTA is prepared for litigation and ready to serve as a model for other parts of the U.S. dealing with congestion.

Trudy asked about the timeline and process for the upcoming fare hearings. John shared that the schedule will be released later in June, and they will be held in advance of Board action on the fare proposals at the July meeting.

Chris noted that reduced fare information should be displayed in all materials about the fare increases.

Discussion: Draft Fare Policy Report, by Kara Gurl and Ryan Leighton

View Presentation here: <https://youtu.be/mTxy8dgo1CI?t=5439>

Kara and Ryan discussed the fare policy research and report that is in development, which focuses on the LIRR and Metro-North's differing fare policy and structures and offers recommendations to better streamline and simplify ticketing and fares. They explained that there are many differences between the two railroads, including differing criteria for applying senior or disabled discounts, peak and off-peak fares, and other eligibility factors that don't align. The goal of the report is to harmonize these policies across the two railroads and integrate them with New York City Transit system. Gerry agreed that the senior and disabled discounts should apply at all times for both railroads.

Walter explained that when he worked for Metro-North, the senior discount did not apply at some times because there was a significant reverse commute to Stamford. He also suggested that fare machines should be programmed to automatically give riders the best fare option available.

Stuart inquired about the official language for “fare” versus “tariff.”

PCAC MINUTES

6

Mike suggested that the report recommendations should include a mission statement, and asked what problem would be solved by implementing a unified price-per-mile between both railroads. He suggested that travel time may be more relevant to price than mile or distance.

Old Business:

None

New Business:

None

Adjourned

YouTube link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mTxy8dgo1CI>

Action Items:

None

The meeting was adjourned at 2:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,
Lisa Daglian
Executive Director