Per Open Meeting Law requirements, an in-person meeting of the Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee (PCAC) was convened at 2 Broadway at 12:00 pm on Thursday, September 14, 2023. Members of the public and Council members unable to attend were present via Zoom.

**Member Attendance**

Gerard Bringmann (Chair) Present

Andrew Albert (Vice Chair) Present

Randolph Glucksman (Vice Chair) Present

Francena Amparo (MNRCC) Absent

Richard Cataggio (MNRCC) Absent

Rosalind Clay Carter (MNRCC) Present

Francis T. Corcoran (MNRCC) Absent

Stuart Goldstein (NYCTRC) Present

Peter Gorry (LIRRCC) Absent

Christopher Greif (NYCTRC) Present

Marisol Halpern (NYCTRC) Absent

Karen D. Hamilton (NYCTRC) Present

Cicely Harris (NYCTRC) Absent

Sharon King Hoge (NYCTRC) Present

Trudy L. Mason (NYCTRC) Present

Scott R. Nicholls (NYCTRC) Absent

Bryan Peranzo (LIRRCC) Absent

Larry Rubinstein (LIRRCC) Absent

Michael Stanton (MNRCC) Present

Burton M. Strauss, Jr. (NYCTRC) Present

Christy Tolbert (LIRRCC) Present— virtual

Walter Zullig (MNRCC) Present

**Staff Attendance**

Lisa Daglian (Executive Director) Present

Kara Gurl (Planning & Advocacy Manager) Present

Jessica Spezio (Administrative Assistant) Present

Ryan Leighton (Intern) Present

**Non-member Attendance**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Name**  Eric Wilson  Lisa Mae Fielder  Andy Kuziemko  David Kupferberg  William Stanford Jr.  Andrew Kurzweil  Mike Howard  Eric Wollman  Debra Greif  Ann Mannino  Jack Connors  Stu Desser  Shaul Picker  Jim Katzenberger  Alex  Carl Perrera  Stephanie DiPetrillo | **Affiliation**  MTA  MTA  MTA  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen  Concerned citizen |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| ***Approval of agenda for September 14, 2023 meeting***  ***Approval of minutes for June 1, 2023 meeting***  **LIRRCC September Chair’s Report:**   * As you all know, the MTA Fare increases recently took effect and we lost a couple of what the MTA considered "pilot programs" that we fought to keep: Atlantic Ticket (which was "replaced" by City Ticket) & the 20-trip peak ticket. The MTA informed me that they heard very few complaints about the elimination of the 20-trip ticket during the public comment period. However, I've heard differently from the riding public since the elimination of this ticket was made official. Unfortunately, a vast majority of the complaints came from LIRR commuters and without riders from both railroads being upset, it's extremely doubtful that we'll be able to get this ticket option restored. * Immediately after Labor Day, the LIRR implemented a new schedule which was revised to reflect riders’ complaints & concerns. While not everyone is happy with the new schedules, it did show that the LIRR is at least trying to listen to & address many of our scheduling issues. One item that remains unaddressed, and that I'll continue to fight for, is the issue of timed connections at Jamaica. While not so much of a problem during the morning rush, a missed "transfer opportunity" in the evening could result in riders going to Port Jefferson or Oyster Bay waiting 45 to 60 minutes for the next train home. The LIRR management is hopeful that the schedule changes will start an upward trend in Customer Satisfaction, as the most recent ridership survey results were extremely disappointing. * There is still no word from MTA management as to when the contract for the M-9a's will be released. This is a major concern, as more rolling stock is needed to help eliminate crowding, as well as retire the M-3 fleet (of approximately 100 cars) which is rapidly approaching the end of its useful life. The last of the original orders of M9s should be delivered to the LIRR by the end of this year. * The MTA Board Members and several elected officials representing Long Island are looking for the MTA to appoint a permanent (& separate) LIRR President. Cathy Rinaldi has been doing an excellent job as interim President, but the concern is that asking her to run the largest Commuter Railroad in North America on a permanent basis, when you're already running the 2nd largest Commuter Rail in the country, is asking a lot of any one individual. While I've been extremely impressed with Cathy's performance to-date in the dual role and see a great benefit in having one person in charge of both so that the LIRR & Metro-North can more easily share "best practices," I feel the concern & believe the request of my fellow board members is legitimate.   Stuart asked if with the last of the original order of train cars, would there be increased service to Penn Station? Gerry advised that there are only about 12 train cars in that batch, so it wouldn’t be enough to change service right now.  Karen asked what will prompt the LIRR to make improvements to the schedule, since 6 months is a long time for riders to wait. She also stressed the missed connections and delays in service affects many commuters still adjusting to the changes.  **MNRCC September Chair’s Report:**   * MNRCC visited the Highbridge Maintenance Facility in the Bronx on August 17. We met at the Information Kiosk at 8:30 AM. Upon arrival of our “tour leaders” we boarded a New Haven Line train that arrived at Grand Central Terminal and was scheduled for maintenance. * A train of New Haven Line M-8 cars delivered us onto one of the tracks inside the maintenance barn. After a safety briefing, PPE was distributed and it was explained what their workers do. Some of the cars were receiving a 90-day “E-Cleaning” where all seats are removed and workers give the interior of the car a thorough cleaning, starting at the ceiling and finishing with the floor. Any seats that are damaged are replaced. This process takes one shift and the train is then returned to service. There is also a car washer in another portion of the facility for the exterior. * Since this facility is not located at a regular passenger stop, our hosts notified the Rail Traffic Control Center that we were ready to be picked up. After a very short wait, a train stopped at the Employee Platform where we boarded and continued with those who were already on board, to Grand Central Terminal. * It was a very interesting trip and the staff sent a thank you to those who made all of the arrangements for our tour.   **NYCTRC September Chair’s Report:**    Service Increases  We have experienced service increases on the C, N, R, 1, and 6 trains in the last month. More information about service increases can be found [here](https://new.mta.info/press-release/mta-announces-service-increases-n-and-r-lines).    Fare Increase  The new subway and bus fare is $2.90 and express buses have gone up to $7. If you're using OMNY, rolling fare capping has begun. More information on the fare changes can be found [here](https://new.mta.info/transparency/mta-fares-tolls-2023).  M7 Wheelchair Pilot  A new pilot has started on M7 buses in Manhattan that allows wheelchair users to board and secure themselves without driver assistance.  Accessible Stations  More stations are becoming accessible, including Bedford Park on the B/D lines, Gun Hill Road on the 5 line, 170th street on the 4 line, and Dykman on the 1 train to name a few. Full list here: [MTA Accessible Stations.](https://new.mta.info/accessibility/stations)  Burt asked about the timeline for stations to be made accessible and Andrew replied that the MTA is looking to do about twenty stations per year.  Stuart asked about tracking the maintenance of the privately-operated elevators so the vendors can service them accordingly.  Trudy mentioned the 4/5 trains constantly slowing down between 42nd Street and 14th Street with no announcements being made.  **Presentation:** Introduction to MTA’s Open Data Program, by Andy Kuziemko, Head of Data & Analytics, and Lisa Mae Fiedler, Open Data Manager  **View presentation with Q&A here:** [**https://youtu.be/Cpd3KfbHo9Y?t=1710**](https://youtu.be/Cpd3KfbHo9Y?t=1710)  Karen asked if the data sets automatically update when used in programs, or does it override the older data. They advised the data updates automatically.  Stuart inquired about the frequency of updates and asked if there is a lag. Lisa Mae informed him that they typically get data from teams in the following month, but some data sets are updated daily.  Trudy asks how her train being delayed today fits into this database. They advised that they are working on service alert data and they have service delivery data.  Stuart asked if other units within the MTA are analyzing the data they provide. Andy answered yes, there are lots of teams at the MTA that are looking at the internal data and using it for their work.  Chris asked about elevator camera data and MetroCard versus OMNY usage data. They advised the comparison data for OMNY usage will be available tomorrow.  Stu Desser inquired about granular train delay data.  **Presentation:** MTA Climate Sustainability Framework, by Eric Wilson, Vice President, Climate Resilience & Sustainability Planning, MTA Construction & Development  **View presentation with Q&A here:** [**https://youtu.be/Cpd3KfbHo9Y?t=3604**](https://youtu.be/Cpd3KfbHo9Y?t=3604)  Eric shared the MTA's climate sustainability framework and the work the MTA is doing to become more sustainable and resilient.  Mike asked how much of the team’s effort is devoted to sustainability versus resiliency? Eric answered that different teams work on these issues but that both are equally devoted.  Stuart asked if there are plans for re-electrifying or electrifying branches in Metro-North territory. Eric said some of those projects are being evaluated now in the Twenty-Year Needs Assessment. He shared that there are a variety of different technologies that could bring sustainability benefits faster, like the implementation of dual mode locomotives to get big sustainability and emissions benefits even faster than electric.  Karen asked about electricity production and if the MTA has solar panels to generate its power. Eric shared information on regenerative braking, where the MTA will capture braking energy from subway trains, store it, and then rerelease it onto the third rail during periods of peak demand. It’s still an experimental project, but it is something that they are looking at to reduce the amount of traction power used.  ***PCAC Elections for Chair, First Vice Chair and Second Vice Chair***   * Gerard Bringmann — Chair, PCAC * Andrew Albert — First Vice Chair, PCAC * Randy Glucksman — Second Vice Chair, PCAC   Trudy moves the nomination and election and Chris seconds it.  ***Executive Director update:***  Lisa thanked Randy for his help last week on issues with New Jersey Transit, in getting a schedule posted for service out to the Meadowlands on Monday night.  She also shared that the OMNY report will soon be released and thanked Ryan for all his work and efforts in the development of the report.  ***Old Business:***  Mr. X suggested that J trains shouldn’t be suspended below Hewes St which isn’t accessible, and it should instead be suspended at Marcy Avenue.  Sharon advised us on the confusion with multiple stations near WTC. She suggested that there needs to be better signage and better communication.  ***New Business:***  Mr. X advised us that at 125th Street station on Metro-North, there are no seats for waiting passengers and that bathroom usage is only available with a ticket. Public bathrooms should be for everyone to use.  Stuart agreed about the bathrooms, adding there are no instructions on how to get a key and mentioned that the station is very dirty and uninviting on the street level.  Chris suggested that CityTicket should show up automatically on the app.   |  | | --- | | **Adjourned** |   **YouTube link:** [**https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Cpd3KfbHo9Y**](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Cpd3KfbHo9Y)  **Action Items:**  **None**  The meeting was adjourned at 2:00 PM.  Respectfully submitted,  Lisa Daglian  Executive Director |